

FY 2021 Comprehensive Annual Performance & Evaluation Report (CAPER)

CITY OF YOUNGSTOWN | SEPTEMBER 2022

Prepared by:

CITY OF YOUNGSTOWN | MULLIN & LONERGAN ASSOCIATES, INC.

CR-05 - Goals and Outcomes

Progress the jurisdiction has made in carrying out its strategic plan and its action plan. 91.520(a)

The primary objective of the consolidated 5-year plan and the one-year action plan is neighborhood stabilization. To help stabilize neighborhoods community policing was used to reduce crime, code enforcement was used gain compliance with housing codes, housing assistance was provide help to low income homeowners in meeting housing standards, blighting influences were removed and public improvements were made to streets and sidewalks in neighborhoods. During PY2020, the City received \$3,574,035 in CDBG, \$303,238 in ESG, and \$694,297 in HOME.

A review of activities undertaken during the program year finds that in all cases CDBG, HOME, and ESG dollars were used to address the objectives and related priorities in the Five Year Consolidated Plan. Details on all HUD expenditures and beneficiaries are provided in HUD's Integrated Disbursement Information System (IDIS). As part of leveraging, other Federally-funded, non-Federally-funded, housing-related activities are included in this CAPER.

The primary uses of the CDBG funds were owner-occupied housing rehabilitation through emergency and limited repairs, public facility and infrastructure improvements, and public services directed toward youth services and crime reduction. These programs meet the high priority needs of Youngstown and are consistent with program objectives. YNDC provided repair services for 71 income-eligible owner-occupied housing units with the intent to improve property values, discourage further vacancy , and improve the quality of life for the area residents. Public facility and infrastructure improvements include updating fire department equipment, street resurfacing, neighborhood beautification through streetscape improvements to reduce blight. These projects were determined to be high priorities based on city resident input.

Funds from the HOME program were primarily used owner-occupied housing rehabilitation. BNOY rehabilitated 3 single-family homes. All beneficiaries were households with incomes between 0-80% AMI.

Emergency Solutions Grants subrecipients include Catholic Charities Regional Agency, COMPASS Family and Community Services, and the Help Network of Northeast Ohio. These organizations provided homeless prevention services, mediation services related to landlord/tenant disputes and evictions, and emergency shelter for youths.

Comparison of the proposed versus actual outcomes for each outcome measure submitted with the consolidated plan and

explain, if applicable, why progress was not made toward meeting goals and objectives. 91.520(g)

Categories, priority levels, funding sources and amounts, outcomes/objectives, goal outcome indicators, units of measure, targets, actual outcomes/outputs, and percentage completed for each of the grantee's program year goals.

Goal	Category	Source / Amount	Indicator	Unit of Measure	Expected – Strategic Plan	Actual – Strategic Plan	Percent Complete	Expected – Program Year	Actual – Program Year	Percent Complete
Assist in creating economic opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	75	174	232.00%	0	0	-
Assist in creating economic opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Jobs created/retained	Jobs	0	0	-	8716	0	0.00%
Assist public service providers	Non-Homeless Special Needs	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	21085	4115	19.52%	17616	3958	22.47%
Blight removal	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	61250	2000	3.27%	1300	0	0.00%
Blight removal	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	0	13	1300.00%	20	13	65.00%
Grant administration	Admin	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	0	0	-	1	1	100.00%

Housing/services to the homeless and near-homeless	Homeless	ESG: \$	Homeless Person Overnight Shelter	Persons Assisted	0	0		441	0	
Housing/services to the homeless and near-homeless	Homeless	ESG: \$	Homelessness Prevention	Persons Assisted	5065	1000		623	0	
Improve quality of existing housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	0	0	-	100	0	0.00%
Improve quality of existing housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Rental units rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	930	46	4.95%			
Improve quality of existing housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	1785	179	10.03%	577	110	19.06%
Improve quality of existing housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Other	Other	0	0	-	1	0	0.00%
Increase supply of housing	Affordable Housing	HOME: \$	Homeowner Housing Added	Household Housing Unit	5	3	60.00%			
Public facility improvements	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	623600	20655	3.31%	43129	19165	44.44%

Public infrastructure improvements	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	109000	38777	35.58%	55459	10665	19.23%
Reduce crime	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	300000	47000	15.67%	23000	40000	173.91%
Repayment of Section 108 Loans	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	0	1	100.00%	1	1	100%

Table 1 - Accomplishments – Program Year & Strategic Plan to Date

Assess how the jurisdiction’s use of funds, particularly CDBG, addresses the priorities and specific objectives identified in the plan, giving special attention to the highest priority activities identified.

The primary objective of the consolidated plan and the action plan is neighborhood stabilization. Activities that propelled this objective were reflected in progress of expended funds for FY 2021. The goals of improving housing stability, reducing crime, providing public facility improvements, and assisting public service providers were sufficiently met. While it appears the goals of blight removal and creation of economic opportunities were not met, these goals overlap with the neighborhood beautification provided through public infrastructure improvements and the public service activities primarily revolving around poverty reduction and youth engagement.

CR-10 - Racial and Ethnic composition of families assisted

Describe the families assisted (including the racial and ethnic status of families assisted).

91.520(a)

	CDBG	HOME	ESG
White	490	6	0
Black or African American	594	12	0
Asian	26	0	0
American Indian or American Native	12	0	0
Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander	1	0	0
Total	1,123	18	0
Hispanic	119	4	0
Not Hispanic	1,004	14	0

Table 2 – Table of assistance to racial and ethnic populations by source of funds

Narrative

The table above includes both families and individuals. Individuals who self-identify as "other multiple race," refused to answer or did not know their race or ethnicity, or did not have their information collected are included in the "Other" category but are not included in the total number of families assisted. The comprehensive data listed in the table does however, show that services provided benefited the city's most economically and socially disadvantaged residents.

CR-15 - Resources and Investments 91.520(a)

Identify the resources made available

Source of Funds	Source	Resources Made Available	Amount Expended During Program Year
CDBG	public - federal	3,574,035	3,998,240.39
HOME	public - federal	694,297	262,000.17
ESG	public - federal	303,238	85,466.95

Table 3 - Resources Made Available

Narrative

The City of Youngstown solicits application from Non-profit organizations and local governments that deliver services to low-income clients within the City of Youngstown's service area may apply for funding. To receive consideration for funding through the City of Youngstown, all non-profit organizations must have their non-profit status and the supporting documentation from the IRS at the time of application. Organizations must demonstrate financial viability to operate a federally funded program on a reimbursement basis and have no real or perceived conflict of interest.

The review process for proposals requesting grant funds consists of a review by City staff and a committee that includes specified City Council members. The staff review verifies that the proposal is one that includes an eligible activity as determined by HUD guidelines. The staff will further evaluate proposals based on information provided in the submitted application. Final awards are available for a 30-day public comment period. Once HUD approves the plan and releases funding, a funding agreement between the City of Youngstown and the subrecipient will be executed.

Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Target Area	Planned Percentage of Allocation	Actual Percentage of Allocation	Narrative Description
CITY OF YOUNGSTOWN	100	100	

Table 4 – Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Narrative

All funding was expended in the target area, which is defined as the City of Youngstown.

Leveraging

Explain how federal funds leveraged additional resources (private, state and local funds), including a description of how matching requirements were satisfied, as well as how any publicly owned land or property located within the jurisdiction that were used to address the needs identified in the plan.

The City of Youngstown continues to give priority to the use of Federal resources to leverage other public and private funds. This is particularly true with respect to development projects, as very rarely do Federal resources cover all of the costs, particularly if the project is more than 2-3 units in size. The City of Youngstown was exempt from the HOME match requirement in 2021 due to fiscal distress; no match was added in 2021. The City of Youngstown has been exempt from the HOME match requirement since 2003.

Fiscal Year Summary – HOME Match	
1. Excess match from prior Federal fiscal year	0
2. Match contributed during current Federal fiscal year	0
3 .Total match available for current Federal fiscal year (Line 1 plus Line 2)	0
4. Match liability for current Federal fiscal year	0
5. Excess match carried over to next Federal fiscal year (Line 3 minus Line 4)	0

Table 5 – Fiscal Year Summary - HOME Match Report

Match Contribution for the Federal Fiscal Year								
Project No. or Other ID	Date of Contribution	Cash (non-Federal sources)	Foregone Taxes, Fees, Charges	Appraised Land/Real Property	Required Infrastructure	Site Preparation, Construction Materials, Donated labor	Bond Financing	Total Match
NONE								

Table 6 – Match Contribution for the Federal Fiscal Year

HOME MBE/WBE report

Program Income – Enter the program amounts for the reporting period				
Balance on hand at begin-ning of reporting period \$	Amount received during reporting period \$	Total amount expended during reporting period \$	Amount expended for TBRA \$	Balance on hand at end of reporting period \$
0	0	0	0	0

Table 7 – Program Income

Minority Business Enterprises and Women Business Enterprises – Indicate the number and dollar value of contracts for HOME projects completed during the reporting period						
	Total	Minority Business Enterprises				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Contracts						
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sub-Contracts						
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Total	Women Business Enterprises	Male			
Contracts						
Number	0	0	0			
Dollar Amount	0	0	0			
Sub-Contracts						
Number	0	0	0			
Dollar Amount	0	0	0			

Table 8 - Minority Business and Women Business Enterprises

Minority Owners of Rental Property – Indicate the number of HOME assisted rental property owners and the total amount of HOME funds in these rental properties assisted						
	Total	Minority Property Owners				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0

Table 9 – Minority Owners of Rental Property

Relocation and Real Property Acquisition – Indicate the number of persons displaced, the cost of relocation payments, the number of parcels acquired, and the cost of acquisition						
Parcels Acquired		0		0		
Businesses Displaced		0		0		
Nonprofit Organizations Displaced		0		0		
Households Temporarily Relocated, not Displaced		0		0		
Households Displaced	Total	Minority Property Enterprises				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Cost	0	0	0	0	0	0

Table 10 – Relocation and Real Property Acquisition

CR-20 - Affordable Housing 91.520(b)

Evaluation of the jurisdiction's progress in providing affordable housing, including the number and types of families served, the number of extremely low-income, low-income, moderate-income, and middle-income persons served.

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	876	0
Number of Non-Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	1,275	0
Number of Special-Needs households to be provided affordable housing units	0	0
Total	2,151	0

Table 11 – Number of Households

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of households supported through Rental Assistance	0	0
Number of households supported through The Production of New Units	0	0
Number of households supported through Rehab of Existing Units	41	0
Number of households supported through Acquisition of Existing Units	0	0
Total	41	0

Table 12 – Number of Households Supported

Discuss the difference between goals and outcomes and problems encountered in meeting these goals.

After a re-evaluation of one-year goals from review goals set in PY2019, the goals for PY2020 were more closely met. The bulk of rehabilitated housing units was provided using CDBG funds through limited and emergency repairs on 69 homeowner-occupied units conducted by YNDC along with roof replacements for at Plaza View Apartments, which contains 28 public housing units. Affordable housing units provided to homeless households will be updated once the Sage Report has been bundled and generated.

The unprecedented 880 households provided rental assistance was a direct result of COVID-19. These households were assisted using CDBG-CV funds to provide short-term rental assistance for Youngstown residents impacted by the pandemic. Additional information on homeless households will be updated once the Sage Report is generated.

Discuss how these outcomes will impact future annual action plans.

The City will strive to meet the goals set forth in PY2020 in future plans. Additionally, provision of affordable housing through rental assistance and rehabilitation will be closely monitored due to the conclusion of the eviction moratorium and rising COVID cases from the Delta variant seasonal changes.

Include the number of extremely low-income, low-income, and moderate-income persons served by each activity where information on income by family size is required to determine the eligibility of the activity.

Number of Households Served	CDBG Actual	HOME Actual
Extremely Low-income	86	0
Low-income	20	0
Moderate-income	15	0
Total	121	0

Table 13 – Number of Households Served

Narrative Information

The number of extremely low-income, low-income, and moderate-income persons served by each activity were derived from PR 03 Activity Summary Report for CDBG activities and PR 23 Summary of Accomplishments for HOME activities.

CR-25 - Homeless and Other Special Needs 91.220(d, e); 91.320(d, e); 91.520(c)

Evaluate the jurisdiction's progress in meeting its specific objectives for reducing and ending homelessness through:

Reaching out to homeless persons (especially unsheltered persons) and assessing their individual needs

Mahoning County has a PATH Homeless Outreach Team. This team goes to places in the community where homeless are typically found unsheltered. The Outreach Team also drives to different areas to talk with businesses about any homeless persons they may encounter. The team frequently goes to the emergency shelter and the local dining halls. While at these locations, they meet with the staff to discuss any persons the team has not met with yet. Street outreach is not funded using ESG funding.

Addressing the emergency shelter and transitional housing needs of homeless persons

Mahoning County currently has one large emergency shelter, a domestic violence shelter through Sojourner House, a youth shelter through Daybreak Youth Crisis Center, and one transitional housing project. A need has recently been identified for a lower barrier emergency shelter. The Mahoning County Homeless Continuum of Care is working to address this need. The domestic violence shelter is able to accommodate any gender, as well as service animals in order to meet the needs of the community.

Helping low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless, especially extremely low-income individuals and families and those who are: likely to become homeless after being discharged from publicly funded institutions and systems of care (such as health care facilities, mental health facilities, foster care and other youth facilities, and corrections programs and institutions); and, receiving assistance from public or private agencies that address housing, health, social services, employment, education, or youth needs

There are two homeless prevention programs in Mahoning County. One provides financial assistance for back payment of utilities and assistance with rent so a person is not evicted. The second program is a mediation service that works with tenants and landlords to prevent an eviction. Other local agencies, such as MYCAP are also able to assist with monetary assistance. Programs, such as Home for Good, help re-integrate justice-involved individuals into society and include providing assistance in finding housing.

It is the responsibility of the recipients of Emergency Solutions Grand funds and of recipients of CoC Program funds that are state and local governments to establish and implement discharge policies that prevent people from being discharged from publicly-funded systems of care into homelessness. These publicly funded systems of care include health and mental health care institutions, correctional facilities and foster care. These systems of care are also subject to various other federal, state and local

regulations and policies that require them to develop discharge plans for people exiting their care.

It is the Continuum of Care's responsibility to coordinate with and/or assist in state and local discharge planning efforts in order to provide those persons responsibility for discharge planning at the state and local government levels the benefit of the Continuum's experience in and knowledge of homelessness.

The Mahoning County Homeless Continuum of Care (MCHCoC) will carry out its responsibility to collaborate with the above-named systems of care by:

1. Providing them with information about housing options available to people being discharged from their care, including information about the Youngstown Metropolitan Housing Authority, other low income housing projects, programs providing rental assistance, and if necessary as a last resort, shelter information;
2. Inviting representatives of these systems of care to MCHCoC member meetings and notifying them of other opportunities to connect and collaborate with individuals and agencies addressing housing issues; and

Contributing information these systems need when applying for funding to meet the housing needs of those being discharged from their care and providing letters of support for such applications.

Helping homeless persons (especially chronically homeless individuals and families, families with children, veterans and their families, and unaccompanied youth) make the transition to permanent housing and independent living, including shortening the period of time that individuals and families experience homelessness, facilitating access for homeless individuals and families to affordable housing units, and preventing individuals and families who were recently homeless from becoming homeless again

The MCHCoC is responsible for helping homeless persons (especially chronically homeless individuals and families, families with children, veterans and their families, and unaccompanied youth) make the transition to permanent housing and independent living. This includes shortening the period of time that individuals and families experience homelessness, facilitating access for homeless individuals and families to affordable housing units, and preventing individuals and families who were recently homeless from becoming homeless again.

The MCHCoC completed its strategic plan in August 2019. An area that the MCHCoC will address in the strategic plan is the length of time a person is homeless. Leaders in the MCHCoC reviewed information from ten community interviews; tours of housing assistance projects; data on homeless trends, system performance, project performance, funding sources and recipients, and Coordinated Entry (CE) to create a more efficient, effective and successful system. Overall, the plan addresses the need to shift focus on providing long-term housing by focusing Rapid Rehousing and permanent supportive housing while increasing the capacity of homeless service providers and the coordinated entry system. MCHCoC

continued to follow this strategic plan for PY2021.

Rapid Re-Housing efforts are spearheaded by Catholic Charities Regional Agency, estimated to have helped over 218 individuals and families within 81 households get re-housed as quickly as possible in 2020.

CR-30 - Public Housing 91.220(h); 91.320(j)

Actions taken to address the needs of public housing

In 2020, YMHA had a public housing occupancy rate averaging 99% throughout the year. Major projects completed in 2020 include:

- Roof replacements for 28 units at the 106-unit Plaza View Apartment using CDBG funds.
- Receipt of \$1,481,853 for the public housing and Housing Choice Voucher programs for the CARES Act.
- Approval for the disposal of 69 obsolete, scattered housing units. Disposition through sale is expected to begin in FY 2021.
- Rehabilitation of a 6-unit building in Boardman Township, with completion expected in FY 2021
- Modernization the 146-unit Kirwan Homes, which includes updates to the exterior design and replacement of roofs, siding, doors, and windows.

Part of YMHA's strategy to improving the living environment of low- and moderate-income households is through Rental Assistance Demonstration (RAD). RAD converts HUD-assisted properties to project-based Section 8 contracts, which YMHA has an additional capacity for. This allows these properties to secure capital and other resources that are restricted under public housing, safeguarding long-term rental units by maintaining them in good condition. YMHA formed an internal RAD taskforce in 2019, training staff on operation requirements and the impacts of RAD conversions. The 150-unit Gutknecht Towers continues to be the largest priority for RAD conversion, with Arlington Heights and the Village at Arlington also being considered.

Additionally, YMHA was continues to operate its EnVison Center. The program serves to empower households to become self-sufficient through on-site services, including opportunities to provided additional economic, educational, health, and leadership opportunities. It is located at their Rockford Village site, holding family and youth programs for residents. In 2020, the EnvVison Center partnered with 19 community partners and provided 30 programs to the Rockford Community. Programs and services include education, tutoring, sports leagues, Girl Scouts, a library, job readiness/job placement, job fairs, nutrition/cooking classes, parenting support, health//dental screenings, fire awareness, neighborhood safety awareness, community fun days, and a pop-up fresh produce market.

In the face of COVID-19, YMHA provided PPE to all employees and face masks to resident households, implementation of streamlined sanitation procedures for common areas, remote work environments, implementation of remote technologies for hearings and housing inspections, implementation of an online system for HCV participants to report changes in family income or family size and check waiting list status, and distributing flyers listing agencies that were able to provide emergency rental assistance for thos experiencing job loss or financial crisis due to the pandemic.

Actions taken to encourage public housing residents to become more involved in management and participate in homeownership

Each property managed by YMHA has a Residents' Council to provide input on the needs of residents and assist in decision-making. Additionally, YMHA's FSS program helps families to find and maintain employment and establish a savings account to ultimately independently maintain their own housing in the future. However, YMHA's Homeownership Education and Counseling Program was discontinued in FY 2020 due to COVID-19 and was not expected to be in operation during FY 2021.

Actions taken to provide assistance to troubled PHAs

YMHA is not troubled.

CR-35 - Other Actions 91.220(j)-(k); 91.320(i)-(j)

Actions taken to remove or ameliorate the negative effects of public policies that serve as barriers to affordable housing such as land use controls, tax policies affecting land, zoning ordinances, building codes, fees and charges, growth limitations, and policies affecting the return on residential investment. 91.220 (j); 91.320 (i)

In November 2020, Youngstown Neighborhood Development Corporation prepared a Housing Conditions Analysis and Strategy to Improve Housing Conditions in partnership with the City of Youngstown and Youngstown State University. The document serves as a key piece in understanding the contributing factors to Youngstown's poor housing conditions and guide stakeholders and decision makers to more effectively coordinate efforts to address local housing needs.

Strategies related to public policy that the City is evaluating feasibility of in the near future include:

- Establish a financial sustainable, performance-based rental licensing and inspection regime to incentivize good landlords and penalize those not in compliance.
- Improve code enforcement tools to address nuisance properties
- Elimination of spot zoning
- Aggressively assist low-income homeowners with home improvements and emergency repairs, as is currently done using CDBG funds.
- Develop and incentivize homebuyers through free housing counseling for potential home buyers and existing homeowners and stronger relationships with banks to improve access to credit and downpayment assistance.
- Extend the Community Reinvestment Area to cover the entire City of Youngstown
- Assign project-based HCVs to housing development projects
- Strategically assemble land and buildings with potential for redevelopment or reuse as housing
- Establish a Housing Trust Fund

Actions taken to address obstacles to meeting underserved needs. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

The City continued to allocate funding to agencies that offer needed services such as health care, re-entry resource services, and youth programs. These agencies that are centrally located and easily accessed by residents who may face barriers such as lack of transportation.

Activities in 2021 that focused on meeting underserved needs include:

- Assisting 117 formerly incarcerated individuals become self-sustaining through the Home for Good Re-Entry Resource Referral Center
- Exposing 54 City youths to multiple career paths, entrepreneurship, and college acceptance requirements through Inspiring Minds Youngstown's Enrichment Program
- Providing 31 youth lunches and school supplies through the Neighborhood Services for All Ages Program

- Offering free classes in visual arts, music, dance, theater, and creative writing year-round for 830 students grades PK-12 through SMARTS public programming
- Assisting 93 residents develop professional skills necessary to become marketable for employment through Flying High Inc's Professional Development Center.
- Provide educational workshops for 2,767 students including cultural activities, career and college fairs, recreation, field trips, and a scholarship event for youth ages 13-19 through the OCCCHA, Inc. Youth Outreach Program
- Exposing 33 City youths to a broad array of entrepreneurial activities through YBI's Youth Entrepreneurship Program

Actions taken to reduce lead-based paint hazards. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

Youngstown provides matching funding to the Mahoning County Lead-Based Paint Hazard Control Program, which serves to make housing units lead safe use a combination of interim controls and lead abatement techniques to reduce environmental health issues in housing. The department administers the State of Ohio's Community Housing Improvement Program for the region to address LBP hazards through repairs and rehabilitation. The Lead Hazard Control Program partners with local hospitals to coordinate screening children and training/educating parents regarding lead and healthy homes issues. All housing rehab projects funded with CDBG or HOME funding conducted by contractors are required to adhere to all applicable lead requirements.

Actions taken to reduce the number of poverty-level families. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

Actions and programs to reduce poverty are focused on retaining and growing local business opportunities along with providing education and job skills training to low- and moderate-income households. A number of programs funded through CDBG dollars are intended to help improve opportunities for number of different individuals, including enrichment and education for youths and job training and housing assistance for justice-involved individuals. Additionally, many businesses are incentivized to hire low-income individuals through grants loans or tax abatements. The accomplishments of these actions overlap with meeting the underserved needs of Youngstown residents.

Actions taken to develop institutional structure. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

The City contributed to developing institutional structure by working closely with regional organizations, including the Mahoning County Homeless Continuum of Care, Eastgate Regional Council of Governments, the Regional Chamber of Commerce, the Western Reserve Port Authority and the Mahoning Rivers Mayors Association. These organizations or consulted with in determining project priorities for activities funded through CDBG and ESG.

Actions taken to enhance coordination between public and private housing and social service agencies. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)

Social service agencies continued to partner with the City to provide needed assistance to families and the City will maintained communication and coordination to ensure their needs are met. With many of these agencies working with poverty-level families, their accomplishments in 2021 were previously addressed.

In April 2020, the City of Youngstown, Youngstown State University's Center for Urban and Regional Studies, and YNDC completed a citywide housing needs assessment to inform citywide decisionmaking on housing and improve housing quality for all Youngstown residents. Highlights from the study include 9.4% to 16.8% of rental units within city limits being considered "substandard housing" as defined by HUD, a 99% occupancy rate in affordable rental properties with large waitlists, pent-up demand for housing serving very low- and low-income renter households, and 92.2% of homes in the area price below \$100,000 and would likely require substantial investment to repair or modernize.

Identify actions taken to overcome the effects of any impediments identified in the jurisdictions analysis of impediments to fair housing choice. 91.520(a)

In accordance with the AI, fair housing training will continue to be offered through the YMHA Homebuyers Club, a collaboration between the PHA, the City's Human Relations Commission, PNC Bank, and other realtors. Topics covered include the homeownership process, spotting and reporting discrimination, protected classes, home financing, credit repair, and predatory lending. Since 2016, the YMHA Homebuyers Club has offered eight training sessions each year. YMHA will also continue providing briefings to public housing and HCV holders on fair housing.

The City's Human Relations Commission acts as the fair housing agency to receive and coordinate investigations of fair housing complaints from citizens. The Commission's staff continued to use test subjects to conduct random surveys of rental and for sale properties to determine if entities are complying with fair housing laws.

CR-40 - Monitoring 91.220 and 91.230

Describe the standards and procedures used to monitor activities carried out in furtherance of the plan and used to ensure long-term compliance with requirements of the programs involved, including minority business outreach and the comprehensive planning requirements

This monitoring plan is a system the City of Youngstown Department of Community Planning and Economic Development (CPED, on behalf of the City of Youngstown) uses to monitor its Community Development Block Grant Program subrecipient agencies to evaluate program and financial compliance. Activities are monitored to access compliance with Department of Housing and Urban Development regulations and the agreement terms, conditions, and policies set by the City of Youngstown.

Authority: Title I of the Housing and Community Development Act of 1974, as amended (42 U.S.C. 5300-5320); sec. 7(d), Department of Housing and Urban Development Act. (42 U.S.C. 3535(d)). Monitoring is an ongoing process of reviewing performance. The CPED monitors use the subrecipient agency data to make judgments about program and financial performance and to assist the subrecipient in improving performance.

The contract compliance monitoring performed by the CPED is different from an annual audit. Monitoring is not an audit of the agency, but rather a focused examination of a specific CDBG-funded activity.

CPED may conduct an annual or an as-needed on-site monitoring visit. CPED will contact the agency to arrange for a monitoring visit. The agency will be informed in writing regarding the initial records to be reviewed. The subrecipient should have records ready for review and a working space set up before the CPED monitor's arrival. CPED nevertheless, conducts quarterly remote or desktop monitoring of all block grant funded activities. Each funded agency is required to submit a quarterly program/financial performance report on October 15, January 15, April 15, and July 15 of the current program year. Each funded agency must also submit an annual program/financial performance report by July 20 of the current program year.

Program Monitoring Goals:

1. To conduct a thorough risk analysis of each subrecipient agency to determine if services are being delivered in accordance with the Agreement between the subrecipient and City of Youngstown. An additional goal of the risk analysis is to determine the need for training and/or technical assistance and the frequency of training conducted for subrecipient agencies.
2. To monitor the scope and focus of services, type of services, number of units, and intended beneficiaries.
3. To review records of subrecipient agencies to determine if systems are in place to properly document the provision of services, client eligibility, and compliance with any other agreement conditions and requirements.

Financial Monitoring Goals:

1. To review subrecipient agencies to determine if costs are being expended in accordance with approved budget and other agreement conditions and requirements.
2. To review records of subrecipient agencies to determine if systems are in place to properly document financial transactions and other uses associated with the block grant allocation.
3. To monitor program income, CHDO profits received and any other financial conditions and requirements.

SUMMARY OF PROGRAM MONITORING PROCESS: The CPED/CDA Division Compliance Department works cooperatively with all subrecipients and contractors to ensure that the use of federal funds meets HUD guidelines and performance standards. The CDA compliance department staff uses checklist set forth in HUD guidelines to monitor program performance. The following steps summarize monitoring standards through monitoring plan implementation:

- Conduct the environmental review process for each federally funded activity.
- Prepare a thorough and comprehensive agreement, which sets forth the project/activity requirements.
- Review on-going written status reports and verbal communication to monitor subrecipients for adherence to allowable timelines and compliance requirements.
- Approve reimbursement requests after stringent review of approved budget summaries, invoices, time sheets, and/or other appropriate documents.
- Prepare quarterly project/activity status reports to measure accomplishments to planned activities and contractual obligations.
- Utilize performance measurement outcome system to assess program progress and effectiveness against outcome and output measures as outlined for the particular activity, project, or program:
- Utilize desk monitoring on an on-going basis (quarterly and as needed).
- Conduct on-site visits as deemed necessary during and after the contract period; and
- Execute corrective or remedial actions as prescribed in 24 CFR 570.10 in the event the subrecipient fails to fulfill the terms and conditions of the established agreement between the subrecipients and the City of Youngstown. The Compliance staff will conduct four or more on-site monitoring reviews during the program year.

Citizen Participation Plan 91.105(d); 91.115(d)

Describe the efforts to provide citizens with reasonable notice and an opportunity to comment on performance reports.

The Community Development Agency division of Community Planning and Economic Development (CPED) posted a draft of the 2021 CAPER for public review and comment during the period

September 9, 2022 through September 23, 2022. The draft was posted on the City of Youngstown website and available in person at City Hall.

CR-45 - CDBG 91.520(c)

Specify the nature of, and reasons for, any changes in the jurisdiction’s program objectives and indications of how the jurisdiction would change its programs as a result of its experiences.

There is no change in the Jurisdiction’s program objectives in PY2021; public service projects will continue to stabilize neighborhoods through public infrastructure and facilities improvements, crime reduction programs, youth services, workforce development, code enforcement, and housing assistance.

Does this Jurisdiction have any open Brownfields Economic Development Initiative (BEDI) grants?

The jurisdiction does not have any open BEDI grants.

[BEDI grantees] Describe accomplishments and program outcomes during the last year.

Not applicable.

CR-50 - HOME 91.520(d)

Include the results of on-site inspections of affordable rental housing assisted under the program to determine compliance with housing codes and other applicable regulations

Please list those projects that should have been inspected on-site this program year based upon the schedule in §92.504(d). Indicate which of these were inspected and a summary of issues that were detected during the inspection. For those that were not inspected, please indicate the reason and how you will remedy the situation.

The City Inspectors completed inspection of HOME-funded rental properties. The housing units met the HQ standards. The housing units are also routinely inspected by Youngstown Metropolitan Housing Authority, the State of Ohio Housing Trust, and City code enforcement.

Provide an assessment of the jurisdiction's affirmative marketing actions for HOME units. 92.351(b)

All of the HOME subrecipients are required to have to have an affirmative marketing program intended to attract prospective buyers regardless of race, color, national origin, disability, religion, familial status, gender, or sexual orientation. The City and subrecipients follow the market regulations cited at 24 CFR 200.620.

Refer to IDIS reports to describe the amount and use of program income for projects, including the number of projects and owner and tenant characteristics

According to PR 09, the jurisdiction did not receive any HOME program income during the program year.

Describe other actions taken to foster and maintain affordable housing. 91.220(k) (STATES ONLY: Including the coordination of LIHTC with the development of affordable housing). 91.320(j)

In addition to HOME funded projects, CDBG funds were used to repair 110 income-eligible owner-occupied properties in 2021. This allows for area residents to maintain their housing and improve their quality of life.

CR-58 – Section 3

Identify the number of individuals assisted and the types of assistance provided

Total Labor Hours	CDBG	HOME	ESG	HOPWA	HTF
Total Number of Activities	0	0	0	0	0
Total Labor Hours					
Total Section 3 Worker Hours					
Total Targeted Section 3 Worker Hours					

Table 14 – Total Labor Hours

Qualitative Efforts - Number of Activities by Program	CDBG	HOME	ESG	HOPWA	HTF
Outreach efforts to generate job applicants who are Public Housing Targeted Workers					
Outreach efforts to generate job applicants who are Other Funding Targeted Workers.					
Direct, on-the job training (including apprenticeships).					
Indirect training such as arranging for, contracting for, or paying tuition for, off-site training.					
Technical assistance to help Section 3 workers compete for jobs (e.g., resume assistance, coaching).					
Outreach efforts to identify and secure bids from Section 3 business concerns.					
Technical assistance to help Section 3 business concerns understand and bid on contracts.					
Division of contracts into smaller jobs to facilitate participation by Section 3 business concerns.					
Provided or connected residents with assistance in seeking employment including: drafting resumes, preparing for interviews, finding job opportunities, connecting residents to job placement services.					
Held one or more job fairs.					
Provided or connected residents with supportive services that can provide direct services or referrals.					
Provided or connected residents with supportive services that provide one or more of the following: work readiness health screenings, interview clothing, uniforms, test fees, transportation.					
Assisted residents with finding child care.					
Assisted residents to apply for, or attend community college or a four year educational institution.					
Assisted residents to apply for, or attend vocational/technical training.					
Assisted residents to obtain financial literacy training and/or coaching.					
Bonding assistance, guaranties, or other efforts to support viable bids from Section 3 business concerns.					
Provided or connected residents with training on computer use or online technologies.					
Promoting the use of a business registry designed to create opportunities for disadvantaged and small businesses.					
Outreach, engagement, or referrals with the state one-stop system, as designed in Section 121(e)(2) of the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act.					

Other.					
--------	--	--	--	--	--

Table 15 – Qualitative Efforts - Number of Activities by Program

Narrative

CR-60 - ESG 91.520(g) (ESG Recipients only)

ESG Supplement to the CAPER in *e-snaps*

For Paperwork Reduction Act

1. Recipient Information—All Recipients Complete

Basic Grant Information

Recipient Name YOUNGSTOWN
Organizational DUNS Number 080156839
UEI
EIN/TIN Number 346003189
Identify the Field Office COLUMBUS
Identify CoC(s) in which the recipient or subrecipient(s) will provide ESG assistance

ESG Contact Name

Prefix Ms
First Name Debra
Middle Name J
Last Name Byrd
Suffix
Title Compliance Director

ESG Contact Address

Street Address 1 26 S Phelps St Fl 4
Street Address 2 26 S. Phelps St. 4th Floor
City Youngstown
State OH
ZIP Code 44503-
Phone Number 3307428876
Extension
Fax Number
Email Address dbyrd@youngstownohio.gov

ESG Secondary Contact

Prefix Mrs
First Name Wendy
Last Name Robinson
Suffix
Title Assistant Compliance Director
Phone Number 3307428887
Extension
Email Address wrobinson@youngstownohio.gov

2. Reporting Period—All Recipients Complete

Program Year Start Date 07/01/2021
Program Year End Date 06/30/2022

3a. Subrecipient Form – Complete one form for each subrecipient

Subrecipient or Contractor Name: YOUNGSTOWN

City: Youngstown

State: OH

Zip Code: 44503, 1130

DUNS Number: 080156839

Is subrecipient a victim services provider: N

Subrecipient Organization Type: Unit of Government

ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount: 22685

Subrecipient or Contractor Name: Compass Family & Community Services

City: Youngstown

State: OH

Zip Code: 44502, 2323

DUNS Number: 020637377

Is subrecipient a victim services provider: Y

Subrecipient Organization Type: Other Non-Profit Organization

ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount: 81526

Subrecipient or Contractor Name: Catholic Charities Regional Agency

City: Youngstown

State: OH

Zip Code: 44502, 1119

DUNS Number: 148761401

Is subrecipient a victim services provider: N

Subrecipient Organization Type: Faith-Based Organization

ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount: 167876

Subrecipient or Contractor Name: Help Network of Northeast Ohio

City: Youngstown

State: OH

Zip Code: 44501, 0046

DUNS Number: 619399686

Is subrecipient a victim services provider: N

Subrecipient Organization Type: Other Non-Profit Organization

ESG Subgrant or Contract Award Amount: 31151

CR-65 - Persons Assisted **PLEASE REFER TO SAGE REPORT**

4. Persons Served

4a. Complete for Homelessness Prevention Activities

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	
Children	
Don't Know/Refused/Other	
Missing Information	
Total	

Table 16 – Household Information for Homeless Prevention Activities

4b. Complete for Rapid Re-Housing Activities

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	
Children	
Don't Know/Refused/Other	
Missing Information	
Total	

Table 17 – Household Information for Rapid Re-Housing Activities

4c. Complete for Shelter

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	
Children	
Don't Know/Refused/Other	
Missing Information	
Total	

Table 18 – Shelter Information

4d. Street Outreach

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	
Children	
Don't Know/Refused/Other	
Missing Information	
Total	

Table 19 – Household Information for Street Outreach

4e. Totals for all Persons Served with ESG

Number of Persons in Households	Total
Adults	
Children	
Don't Know/Refused/Other	
Missing Information	
Total	

Table 20 – Household Information for Persons Served with ESG

5. Gender—Complete for All Activities

	Total
Male	
Female	
Transgender	
Don't Know/Refused/Other	
Missing Information	
Total	

Table 21 – Gender Information

6. Age—Complete for All Activities

	Total
Under 18	
18-24	
25 and over	
Don't Know/Refused/Other	
Missing Information	
Total	

Table 22 – Age Information

7. Special Populations Served—Complete for All Activities

Number of Persons in Households

Subpopulation	Total	Total Persons Served – Prevention	Total Persons Served – RRH	Total Persons Served in Emergency Shelters
Veterans				
Victims of Domestic Violence				
Elderly				
HIV/AIDS				
Chronically Homeless				
Persons with Disabilities:				
Severely Mentally Ill				
Chronic Substance Abuse				
Other Disability				
Total (unduplicated if possible)				

Table 23 – Special Population Served

CR-70 – ESG 91.520(g) - Assistance Provided and Outcomes

10. Shelter Utilization

Number of New Units – Rehabbed	
Number of New Units – Conversion	
Total Number of bed - nights available	
Total Number of bed - nights provided	
Capacity Utilization	

Table 24 – Shelter Capacity

11. Project Outcomes Data measured under the performance standards developed in consultation with the CoC(s)

Homeless assistance project performance will be monitored on a quarterly basis for all objectives via the HMIS generated Annual Performance Report (APR). The cumulative APR will provide project-level performance information for each objective listed in this plan and will be shared with the full MCHCoC each quarter. The Report will be generated from HMIS approximately 10 days after the end of each quarter. Providers must ensure their HMIS data has been updated, and is accurate, prior to the generation of each report. Each Provider is responsible to submit their quarterly APR Report, PDF formatted, by email to the MCHCoC Director and the P&O Committee Chairperson.

The quarters are as follows:

- 1st Reporting Period = January 1 – March 31 Reports performance data for first quarter
- 2nd Reporting Period = January 1 – June 30 Reports performance data for first and second quarters
- 3rd Reporting Period = January 1 – September 30 Reports performance data for first, second and third quarters
- 4th Reporting Period = January 1 – December 31 Reports performance data for the full year All projects should review their quarterly performance data and contact the MCHCoC with any questions or concerns. Projects that consistently fail to meet project performance objectives should develop internal plans and processes for improvement.

HMIS Data Quality

In addition to reporting performance on each Project Performance Objective, the APR also will report on the percentage of missing data applicable to the reporting period and objective for each project. Projects with more than 2% missing data do not have high enough data quality for allowance of performance measurement (with the exception of the measures examining exits to PH). *Projects with*

more than 2% missing data for ANY objective will be considered to have failed to achieve the objective.
Continuous data quality issues could result in required development of a Quality Improvement Plan (QIP) and/or the loss of CoC Program or State Funding.

CR-75 – Expenditures

11. Expenditures

11a. ESG Expenditures for Homelessness Prevention

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2019	2020	2021
Expenditures for Rental Assistance			
Expenditures for Housing Relocation and Stabilization Services - Financial Assistance	\$4,138.24	\$19,486.00	
Expenditures for Housing Relocation & Stabilization Services - Services	\$44,874.24	\$30,430.22	
Expenditures for Homeless Prevention under Emergency Shelter Grants Program			
Subtotal Homelessness Prevention	\$49,012.48	\$49,916.22	

Table 25 – ESG Expenditures for Homelessness Prevention

11b. ESG Expenditures for Rapid Re-Housing

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2019	2020	2021
Expenditures for Rental Assistance	\$23,775.00	\$64,927.00	
Expenditures for Housing Relocation and Stabilization Services - Financial Assistance			
Expenditures for Housing Relocation & Stabilization Services - Services			
Expenditures for Homeless Assistance under Emergency Shelter Grants Program			
Subtotal Rapid Re-Housing	\$23,775.00	\$64,927.00	

Table 26 – ESG Expenditures for Rapid Re-Housing

11c. ESG Expenditures for Emergency Shelter

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2019	2020	2021
Essential Services		\$128,267.28	
Operations	\$78,564.00	\$54,678.45	
Renovation			
Major Rehab			
Conversion			
Subtotal	\$78,564.00	\$182,945.73	

Table 27 – ESG Expenditures for Emergency Shelter

11d. Other Grant Expenditures

	Dollar Amount of Expenditures in Program Year		
	2019	2020	2021
Street Outreach			
HMIS	\$21,600.00		
Administration	\$41,910.00	\$18,508.00	

Table 28 - Other Grant Expenditures

11e. Total ESG Grant Funds

Total ESG Funds Expended	2019	2020	2021
	\$214,861	\$316,296.95	

Table 29 - Total ESG Funds Expended

11f. Match Source

	2019	2020	2021
Other Non-ESG HUD Funds			
Other Federal Funds			
State Government	\$116,000	\$ 146,646	
Local Government	\$24,000	\$ 25,000	
Private Funds	\$69,570	\$ 2,310	
Other	\$13,000	\$ 85,144	
Fees			
Program Income			
Total Match Amount	\$222,570	\$ 259,100	

Table 30 - Other Funds Expended on Eligible ESG Activities

11g. Total

Total Amount of Funds Expended on ESG Activities	2019	2020	2021
	\$437,431	\$575,396.95	

Table 31 - Total Amount of Funds Expended on ESG Activities