



# HOME-ARP ALLOCATION PLAN

Community Development Division

## Table of Contents

Consultation.....	2
Public Participation .....	7
Needs Assessment and Gaps Analysis .....	7
HOME-ARP Activities.....	19
HOME-ARP Production Housing Goals.....	21
Preferences .....	22
Referrals Methods .....	23
Limitations in a HOME-ARP rental housing or NCS project .....	24
HOME-ARP Refinancing Guidelines .....	25
Appendix A: Consultation Appendix .....	26
Appendix B: Citizen Participation.....	27
Appendix C: SF424s/Certifications.....	28

## Consultation

***Describe the consultation process including methods used and dates of consultation:***

See Appendix A for all Stakeholder Consultation materials, including outreach materials, meeting invitees, meeting attendees and participant comments. Stakeholder comments received throughout these various sessions and individual meetings are summarized below, in the Appendix, and are referenced appropriately throughout the Needs Assessment & Gaps Analysis.

The City of Youngstown engaged in an extensive stakeholder consultation process. During this time, the City engaged with a variety of shelter and service providers serving each of the qualifying populations; the Continuum of Care; emergency shelter operators; Compass Family Community Services; victim service providers; supportive housing providers; service providers serving all four of the qualifying populations; Veterans groups; and organizations addressing fair housing and Civil Rights in the City.

Each of the focus group sessions focused on identifying the Qualifying Populations and their unmet housing and service needs. A brief Power Point presentation on the HOME-ARP program was presented followed by questions meant to engage participants in identifying unmet needs among the qualifying populations they served.

***List the organizations consulted:***

Focus Group Topic/ Agency	Method of Consultation	Type of Agency(ies)/Org
Mahoning County Continuum of Care	Virtual Interview	Continuum of Care Public Agencies that address the needs of the qualifying populations
Compass Family Community Services/Sojourner House	Virtual Interview	Providers serving the homeless, victims of domestic violence, veterans' groups
Help Hotline Crisis Center	Virtual Interview	Providers serving the homeless, at-risk of homeless, victims of domestic violence
HIV/AIDS Ministry	Virtual Interview	Providers serving the homeless, at-risk of homeless Agencies that address the needs of people with disabilities

Focus Group Topic/ Agency	Method of Consultation	Type of Agency(ies)/Org
Help Network of Northeast Ohio	Virtual Interview	Providers serving the homeless, at-risk of homeless, victims of domestic violence
Catholic Charities	Virtual Interview	Providers serving all four qualifying populations
Ursuline Center	Virtual Interview	Providers serving the homeless, victims of domestic violence
YWCA Mahoning Valley	Virtual Interview	Providers serving all four qualifying populations Agency addressing the needs of people with disabilities
Coleman Professional Services	Virtual Interview	Providers serving all four qualifying populations Agency addressing the needs of people with disabilities
Veteran’s Haven	Virtual Interview	Providers serving all four qualifying populations Agency addressing the needs of people with disabilities Veterans Groups
Public Housing Authority	Virtual Interview/email survey	Public Housing Authority

Focus Group Topic/ Agency	Method of Consultation	Type of Agency(ies)/Org
MYCAP	Virtual Interview	Providers serving all four qualifying populations Agency addressing the needs of people with disabilities
Home for Good Resource Referral	Virtual Interview	Providers serving all four qualifying populations Agency addressing the needs of people with disabilities
Beatitude House	Virtual Interview	Providers serving the homeless, victims of domestic violence
Community Legal Aid	Virtual Interview/email survey	Agencies addressing civil rights/fair housing
Mahoning County Fair Housing Office	Virtual Interview	Agencies addressing civil rights/fair housing
City of Youngstown Health Commissioner	Virtual Interview	Public Agencies that address the needs of all four qualifying populations
Flying High	Virtual Interview	Providers serving all four qualifying populations Agency addressing the needs of people with disabilities
Youngstown State University	Virtual Interview	Providers serving the homeless, at risk of homeless Public Agencies that address the needs of the homeless, at risk of homeless

**Summarize feedback received and results of upfront consultation with these entities:**

The City is characterized by an aging housing stock; often there are insufficient units to accommodate larger families; housing often fails to pass HQS/habitability standards in order to receive voucher or other rental assistance. Generally, stakeholders expressed a need for additional affordable inventory, as well as low-barrier shelter options.

**Continuum of Care/Coordinated Entry**

- The CoC, which covers the City of Youngstown and Mahoning County, continues to prioritize PSH and RRH, especially the development of housing for people experiencing homelessness
- Supportive housing would require voucher support from YMHA in order to operate successfully

- There is a need for low barrier shelter in the City; NCS is appealing in response to pandemic
  - LGBTQ+ shelter is a need
- DV population requires additional transitional supports that are not widely available to assist in transitioning from shelter to permanent housing
- There are barriers to accessing housing for the re-entry/criminal justice involved populations, including their criminal record, ineligibility for permanent housing/HCV, untreated co-occurring mental health/substance misuse disorders, parole. NCS would be beneficial for this population.
- Engagement/case management is critical to ensuring stability in housing, but staff capacity among service providers is extremely limited. There are insufficient case managers available to meet the needs of the QPs, due to low wages, burnout.
- Availability of case managers during non-traditional hours is a system gap-a needed service but generally unavailable.

### Shelter Providers

- Shelters have insufficient capacity, both bed and staff
- Overnight shelters that close during the day leave no where for people experiencing homelessness to go. One suggested development is a drop in center, that would provide space for people to go during the day, but also provide services, navigation assistance, etc. (one-stop shop)
- Low barrier shelter is a need, especially for women and children
- Immediate shelter is often not available, transitional housing/longer-term shelter is not available
- Many individuals that exit prison, exit to emergency shelter due to the lack of affordable housing. Some stay with family, but this is not designed to be a permanent solution/placement
- 

### Service Providers

- Individuals/households that are “doubled up” often are underserved because their homeless status cannot easily be established for CoC-funded programs
- There continues to be a large gap in the number of quality affordable and accessible units available for rent in the City. In addition, the number of landlords willing to accept vouchers and work with special needs populations is dwindling.
  - The habitability and HQS inspections prove rigorous and burdensome for some landlords and they are unwilling to participate or refuse to make needed repairs
  - Rents have been increasing, FMR/Payment Standards cannot compete with market rents; landlords can be selective in who they lease to given the state of the market and rents they can demand
  - Landlords requiring more than 3x monthly rent in order to approve tenancy
- The ability to provide utility assistance is a gap in the system, particularly large utility arrears that prevent a household from being able to lease a unit and open utilities in their name.
- There is insufficient inventory of larger units to accommodate families with 4+ children; households will take a smaller unit and experience overcrowded conditions in order to have a home

- Youngstown State University indicated that there is also a gap in available single bedroom units for students experiencing homelessness
- Barriers to accessing housing include poor rental history, criminal history, utility arrears, debt owed to PHAs
- Recovery housing is a need. Many times, units that are available are not in locations that are conducive to recovery or stability. Addiction can often lead to returns to homelessness. Transitional housing has been effective, but households lose homeless status and are then ineligible for PSH
- Case Management services for those on the CE waiting list, particularly the chronically homeless, are needed to coordinate/assist individuals navigate the system.
- Criminal history, poor credit, eviction, convictions are barriers for homeless veterans to access housing, even at the YMHA
- Needed services that are not widely available include case management, system navigation, housing search and placement, childcare, transportation, ongoing utility assistance, job training/placement
- Services to assist households in crisis address immediate needs are generally unavailable-there is a focus on long term stability rather than addressing the immediate needs

### Civil Rights

- Since 2020, 2,307 eviction cases have been filed in Youngstown Municipal Court
- In many eviction cases, the landlord has counsel and the tenant does not. In communities where there is a right to counsel, there is a higher rate of tenants remaining in their home or getting additional time to find a home and move. Community Legal Aid is working to institute this program in Youngstown, however, it will depend on funding.

### Public Housing Authority

- Landlords have been leaving the HCV program to sell their units; new owners unwilling to participate in the program/lease to voucher holders. Recruiting new landlords has been difficult because market rents are significantly higher than YMHA Payment Standards (105% of FMR)
- Steady rises in the costs of housing, coupled with poor condition of units, results in 7% unused voucher rate.
- Housing inventory limited
- One bedroom units are difficult to find within FMR and Payment Standards.

## Public Participation

**Describe the public participation process, including information about and the dates of the public comment period and public hearing(s) held during the development of the plan:**

- **Date(s) of public notice: 1/20/2023**
- **Public comment period: start date – 1/27/2023 end date – 2/10/2023**
- **Date(s) of public hearing: 2/8/2023**

**Describe the public participation process:**

**Describe efforts to broaden public participation:**

**Summarize the comments and recommendations received through the public participation process either in writing, or orally at a public hearing:**

**Summarize any comments or recommendations not accepted and state the reasons why:**

Enter narrative response here.

## Needs Assessment and Gaps Analysis

Similar to many communities across the United States, the City of Youngstown struggles with meeting the needs of its unhoused and extremely low-income residents. The following data analysis uses information from the HUD 2022 Continuum of Care Housing Inventory Count report for the Mahoning County Continuum of Care, of which Youngstown is a member. Where possible, data points specific to the City have been extracted and identified. In addition, Point in Time Counts (PIT), 2015-2019 Comprehensive Housing Affordability Strategy (CHAS) data, CoC APR data, and more were used to determine the needs of the community. The following analysis also includes input derived from consultations with Youngstown community stakeholders, including CoC representatives, public housing authorities, non-profit social service providers, disability advocates, and emergency shelter providers.

### OPTIONAL Homeless Needs Inventory and Gap Analysis Table

	Homeless								
	Current Inventory			Homeless Population				Gap Analysis	
	Family	Adults Only	Total	Family HH (at least 1 child)	Adult HH (w/o child)	Vets	Victims of DV	Family	Adults Only
# of Beds	# of Beds	# of Beds					# of Beds	# of Beds	
Emergency Shelter	130	107	247						



Transitional Housing	10	3	13						
Safe Haven	0	3	3						
Permanent Supportive Housing	335	162	497						
Rapid Re-Housing	38	16	54						
Sheltered				20	100	10	10		
Unsheltered				0	12	0	0		
<b>Current Gaps</b>									

\*Other Permanent Housing includes Safe Haven and Rapid Re-Housing beds. Source: HUD 2021 HIC; HIC Total Summary for PA-605;

The City of Youngstown also has a need for affordable housing. The shortage of units both affordable and available for renter households at or below 30% area median income (AMI) increases housing insecurity and rent pressures on extremely low-income households.

#### Non-Homeless Needs Inventory and Gaps Analysis Table

Non-Homeless			
	Current Inventory	Level of Need	Gap Analysis
	# of Units	# of Households	# of Households
Total Rental Units	12,990		
Rental Units Affordable to HH at 30% AMI (At-Risk)	5,385		
Rental Units Affordable to HH at 50% AMI (Other Populations)	3,120		
0%-30% AMI Renter HH w/1 or more severe housing problems (At-Risk)		5,795	
30%-50% AMI Renter HH w/1 or more severe housing problems (Other Populations)		1,975	
<b>Current Gaps</b>			735
Non-Homeless			
	Current Inventory	Level of Need	Gaps Analysis
	# of Units	# of Households	# of Households
Total Rental Units	21,385		
Rental Units Affordable to HH at 30% AMI (At-Risk of Homelessness)	3,945		
Rental Units Affordable to HH at 50% AMI (Other Populations)	8,024		
0%-30% AMI Renter HH w/ 1 or more severe		4,420	

housing problems (At-Risk of Homelessness)			
30%-50% AMI Renter HH w/ 1 or more severe housing problems (Other Populations)		3,215	
Current Gaps			6,740

Source: Comprehensive Housing Affordability Strategy data (CHAS)

***Describe the size and demographic composition of qualifying populations within the PJ's boundaries:***

***Homeless as defined in 24 CFR 91.5***

The number of Youngstown residents that meet the definition of homeless under 24 CFR 91.5 was derived from the 2022 PIT Count for the Youngstown/Mahoning County Continuum of Care. The PIT count identified a total of 174 persons experiencing homelessness in 2022, up from 100 persons in 2020. Of the counted homeless individuals in 2022, 160 (92.0%) were sheltered and 14 (8.0%) were unsheltered. In 2020, four sheltered individuals were unaccompanied children under the age of 18, compared to two sheltered unaccompanied children under the age of 18 identified in 2022. In 2020, six of the identified individuals were chronically homeless adults; three were sheltered and three were unsheltered. This can be compared to 2022, when five of the identified individuals were chronically homeless, all of which were sheltered. In terms of racial and ethnic demographics in the 2022 PIT, 83 (47.7%) of homeless individuals were White, 71 (40.8%) were Black/African American, 18 (10.3%) were Multi-Racial, and 7 (4.0%) were Hispanic.

Between January 1<sup>st</sup> 2021 and December 31<sup>st</sup> 2021, a total of approximately 1,341 homeless persons were served by the Youngstown/Mahoning County Continuum of Care. About 37.7% (492 persons) of which were served by emergency shelter, permanent supportive housing, rapid re-housing, and transitional housing programs located in the City of Youngstown. The breakdown of the population served in Youngstown is depicted in the table below.

Program	City of Youngstown	CoC
Emergency Shelter	123	-
Permanent Supportive Housing	175	515
Rapid Re-Housing	181	723
Transitional Housing	13	55
Safe Haven	-	2
Street Outreach	-	46
<b>Total</b>	<b>492</b>	<b>1,341</b>

Source: 2021 APR Data

According to the FY 2021 Performance Measure Module, 91 individuals experienced homelessness for the first time. This is a slight decrease (-5 persons) from 2020, which had 96 persons experiencing homelessness for the first time; however, eviction moratoria and other assistance available in response

to the pandemic may have impacted these figures. These measures took into account persons entering emergency shelter, transitional housing, safe haven, and permanent supportive housing programs.

According to HMIS data, 235 people (47.8%) served by emergency shelter, transitional housing, permanent supportive housing, and rapid re-housing programs in the City of Youngstown identified as White, while 216 (43.9%) identified as Black/African American/African. 44 persons (8.9%) identified as Hispanic. While this appears to reflect the racial and ethnic makeup of the City according to 2020 Census data, the distribution is less equal when looking at each program separately. For example, those who identified as White were over-represented among those served by permanent supportive housing programs in the City. Of those participating in permanent supportive housing programs in the City, 105 identified as White, while only 56 identified as Black/African American/African. On the other hand, among those participating in rapid re-housing programs in the City, 98 persons identified as Black/African American/African compared to 67 persons who identified as White. The distribution is reflected in the table below.

	<b>Emergency</b>	<b>Permanent Supportive Housing</b>	<b>Rapid Re-Housing</b>	<b>Transitional Housing</b>	<b>Total</b>
White	55	105	67	8	235
Black, African American, or African	57	56	98	5	216
Asian or Asian American	1	0	0	0	1
American Indian, Alaska Native, or Indigenous	1	0	0	0	1
Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander	1	0	0	0	1
Multiple Races	4	14	16	0	34
Non-Hispanic	99	168	169	12	448
Hispanic	24	7	12	1	44

Source: 2021 APR Data

As of September 21<sup>st</sup>, 2022, there were 421 households making up 681 individuals in the Coordinated Entry System. It is important to note that while this is the number reported, there is speculation that people are not being exited from the system as they should be, thus the number is likely higher than the actual homeless population within the community. The PIT count identified a total of 174 persons experiencing homelessness in 2022. Between January 1<sup>st</sup> 2021 and December 31<sup>st</sup> 2021, a total of approximately 1,341 homeless persons were served by the Youngstown/Mahoning County Continuum of Care. About 37.7% (492 persons) of which were served by emergency shelter, permanent supportive housing, rapid re-housing, and transitional housing programs located in the City of Youngstown.

***At Risk of Homelessness as defined in 24 CFR 91.5***

According to 2015-2019 CHAS data, there are 7,710 (27.6% ) total residents in either owner-occupied or renter occupied housing with an annual income below 30% of median family income. Renters, who are considered disproportionately at-risk, numbered 5,115 or 66.3% of those with household income at or below 30% of the median family income. Additionally, 6,704, or 48.3% of renter households in the City of Youngstown are considered cost burdened, spending more than 30% of their income on housing costs.

There are 180, or 1.4% of renter households in the City of Youngstown that are living in severely overcrowded housing conditions with more than 1.5 persons per room.

Based on HMIS data for the January 1<sup>st</sup>, 2021-December 31<sup>st</sup>, 2021period, 17.4% of leaver households exited to temporary destinations.<sup>1</sup> Exiting to a temporary destination may indicate greater risk of returning to the homeless system.

As housing becomes increasingly less affordable, more households are facing eviction. In 2017, 1,193 eviction cases were filed in the Youngstown Municipal Court, of those, 518 writs were issued. In 2020, this jumped to approximately 2,307 cases filed in the Youngstown Municipal Court. In many cases, the landlord has legal counsel while the tenant does not, and Community Legal Aid Services in Youngstown works to provide legal counsel to those tenants in need. Community Legal Aid Services has been able to assist only 156 families with evictions since January 2021, Not only is there a gap in these types of services for those facing eviction, but it is these communities at-risk of eviction that could find themselves at-risk of homelessness.

In addition, the City of Youngstown disseminated MYCAP Covid-funding rental assistance during FY 2021 for approximately 50 households. Households requiring rental assistance may be at greater risk of experiencing homelessness if they cannot sustain ongoing rent and utility payments.

***Fleeing, or Attempting to Flee, Domestic Violence, Dating Violence, Sexual Assault, Stalking, or Human Trafficking, as defined by HUD in the Notice***

Based on HMIS data for the January 1<sup>st</sup>, 2021-December 31<sup>st</sup>, 2021 period, 110 persons served by Youngstown emergency shelter, permanent supportive housing, rapid re-housing, and transitional housing programs are adults with a history of domestic violence. Additionally, 29 persons served reported fleeing domestic violence.

Compass Family and Community Services operates Sojourner House, which provides shelter, counseling and crisis intervention services for victims of domestic violence in Mahoning County, which includes the City of Youngstown. In 2021, Sojourner served 620 survivors: 48% were Black, 30% White, 4% Hispanic, and 12% multiple races. 25% were sheltered children. 80% of survivors reported as female. 40-45% of sheltered survivors present with substance use disorders. Data was not readily available on the number of people fleeing human trafficking; however, Sojourner House reported in November 2022 that six individuals that presented at their facility reported they were victims of human trafficking.

***Other populations requiring services or housing assistance to prevent homelessness and other populations at greatest risk of housing instability, as defined by HUD in the Notice***

---

<sup>1</sup> Universe: Programs within the City of Youngstown

Those at greatest risk of housing instability include 3,070 renter households with an annual income less than or equal to 30% AMI and experiencing severe cost burden. This represents 24.4% of all renter households in the City. In addition, there are 180 renter households in the City that are living in severely overcrowded housing conditions, all of which are at less than or equal to 50% AMI.

Other populations at greater risk of housing instability as identified in the 2022 PIT Count include 48 persons with severe mental illness, 65 persons with a substance use disorder, and 10 veterans. See the following breakdown of these populations’ sheltered and unsheltered status below:

	Sheltered			Unsheltered	Total
	Emergency	Transitional	Safe Haven		
Adults with Serious Mental Illness	43	5	0	0	48
Adults with Substance Use Disorder	62	2	1	0	65
Adults with HIV/AIDS	1	0	0	0	1
Veterans	4	3	3	0	10

Source: 2022 PIT Count Youngstown/Mahoning County CoC

During the January 1<sup>st</sup>, 2021 to December 31<sup>st</sup>, 2021 period, 45 households exited emergency shelter, permanent supportive housing, rapid re-housing, or transitional housing programs in the City to temporary destinations. Of these, one exited to a place not meant for habitation, four exited to transitional housing for homeless persons, and five exited to an emergency shelter. The majority exited to temporary stays with friends or family. Households receiving temporary assistance and those exiting to temporary destinations are more likely to return to homelessness or face greater risk of housing instability than those exiting to permanent destinations. Of those that exited emergency shelter, permanent supportive housing, rapid re-housing, or transitional housing programs within the City, 48 adult leavers (30.6%) exited with no cash income, putting these households at greater risk of returning to homelessness if unable to support ongoing housing payments.

***Identify and consider the current resources available to assist qualifying populations, including congregate and non-congregate shelter units, supportive services, TBRA, and affordable and permanent supportive rental housing (Optional):***

Veteran’s Haven of Mahoning and Trumbull Counties provides transitional housing, supportive services and shelter for homeless Veterans.

According to the 2022 HIC Summary for the Youngstown/Mahoning County Continuum of Care, 339 year-round beds were counted for households without children, 513 year-round beds for households with children, and 10 year-round beds for households with children. Of those, 24 year-round beds were dedicated to victims of domestic violence.

The Youngstown Metro Housing Authority (YMHA) owns and manages 1,165 units of public housing. In addition, YMHA has approximately 2,280 Housing Choice Vouchers. Current waiting lists for both programs have 5,700 and 869 households, respectively.

***Describe the unmet housing and service needs of qualifying populations:***

***Homeless as defined in 24 CFR 91.5***

HMIS indicated that 492 individuals (334 households) were served by the homeless system within the City of Youngstown during the January 1<sup>st</sup>, 2021-December 31<sup>st</sup>, 2021 period. For comparison, the Continuum of Care as a whole served approximately 1,341 individuals (728 households) during the same period.

According to the 2022 HIC, the Youngstown/Mahoning County Continuum of Care has approximately 456 year-round permanent supportive housing beds, of which most are estimated to be occupied. The Continuum of Care also has 93 year-round emergency shelter, transitional housing, rapid re-housing, and safe haven beds. This available inventory is insufficient to meet the needs of the population experiencing homelessness. All stakeholders consulted for this process expressed the same overwhelming need: affordable rental housing. Stakeholders also reported the need for low-barrier shelter in the City, particularly for LGBTQ+ populations.

The City collaborates with developers to invest its HOME funds in rental housing to expand the inventory of affordable rental units. However, many of those participating in consultations reported that even units developed with federal and other subsidies are not affordable to the extremely low-income populations. Further, there is increased competition for fewer affordable units. Deeply subsidized units are needed in order to fill this gap in the available housing inventory.

According to stakeholders, intensive case management and wrap-around supportive services are required while homeless individuals and families wait for available housing, and must continue once they are placed in housing. Currently services are generally available only once households are placed in housing. While numerous service providers are available in the City, their capacity to provide adequate levels of supportive services are strained due to staff shortages, staff burnout, and insufficient staff wages. In addition, stakeholders reported the need for availability of case managers during non-traditional hours is a system gap-a needed service but generally unavailable.

#### ***At Risk of Homelessness as defined in 24 CFR 91.5***

According to 2015-2019 CHAS data, there are approximately 425 vacant for-rent housing units, 270 (63.5%) of which are affordable to households making 0-30% AMI. Additionally, 95 (22.4%) of vacant for-rent housing units are affordable to households making 30-50% AMI, 35 (8.2%) vacant for-rent housing units are affordable to households making 50-80% AMI, and 20 (4.7%) vacant for-rent housing units are affordable to households making over 80% AMI. The supply of affordable housing units is insufficient for households earning 0-30% AMI because renter households earning 81%+ AMI also do not have enough available units appropriately affordable to them. This leads to many high-earning households residing in housing units that would be affordable to lower-income households, including those with income below 30% AMI. As a result, these households must reside in housing units that are more costly than what would be considered affordable to these households. The low vacancy rates of rental units affordable to those with higher incomes is indicative of a strong demand for more affordable housing. Furthermore, this does not consider additional costs such as transportation, childcare, and accessibility modifications for individuals with disabilities. With 48.3% of all Youngstown renters considered cost burdened and 31.7% of renter households considered severely cost burdened, these additional costs further exacerbate the limited access to affordable housing in the City. Among extremely low-income households, who represent 40.7% of all renters in the City, 77.0% are severely cost burdened and at risk of experiencing homelessness. This further suggests that the supply of affordable housing options for housing low-income households is insufficient.

	Total		Cost burdened		Severely Cost burdened	
	#	%	#	%	#	%
Total Renters	12,565	-	6,074	48.3%	3,985	31.7%
Very Low-Income Renters (0-50% AMI)	8,140	64.8%	5,519	90.9%	3,750	94.1%
30-50% AMI	3,025	24.1%	1,954	32.2%	680	17.1%
Extremely Low-Income Renters (0-30% AMI)	5,115	40.7%	3,565	58.7%	3,070	77.0%

Source: 2015-2019 CHAS

Stakeholders identified the production and preservation of affordable rental housing as one of the City of Youngstown’s priorities.

According to stakeholders, needed services that are not widely available include case management, system navigation, housing search and placement, childcare, transportation, ongoing utility assistance, and job training/placement. In addition, Community Legal Aid Services indicated that services and the right for tenant counsel is critical to ensuring keeping people housed.

Poor rental history was identified as a barrier for households accessing affordable households. Rental assistance and legal services for eviction prevention could potentially be effective mechanisms to help salvage tenancies of at-risk populations and to prevent poor rental history from becoming a barrier for future tenancies. Stakeholders also reported that individuals/households that are “doubled up” often are underserved because their homeless status cannot easily be established for CoC-funded programs.

***Fleeing, or Attempting to Flee, Domestic Violence, Dating Violence, Sexual Assault, Stalking, or Human Trafficking, as defined by HUD in the Notice***

Based on HMIS data for the January 1st, 2021-December 31st, 2021 period, 110 persons served by Youngstown emergency shelter, permanent supportive housing, rapid re-housing, and transitional housing programs are adults with a history of domestic violence. Additionally, 29 persons served reported fleeing domestic violence. According to the 2022 HIC, there are only 24 year-round beds dedicated for survivors of domestic violence. Transitional housing has been identified as a successful model for individuals fleeing domestic violence and human trafficking, particularly when finding permanent affordable housing is difficult; however, HIC data indicates there are few transitional housing options available. This is supported by stakeholder input, which indicated that this qualifying population requires additional transitional supports that are not widely available to assist in transitioning from shelter to permanent housing.

***Other populations requiring services or housing assistance to prevent homelessness and other populations at greatest risk of housing instability as defined by HUD in the Notice***

According to HMIS data, during the period January 1<sup>st</sup>, 2021-December 31<sup>st</sup>, 2021, 259 individuals exited the homeless system in Youngstown. Of these, 146 (56.4%) exited to permanent destinations, 45 (17.4%) exited to temporary destinations, and 14 (5.4%) exited to institutional settings. Households without permanent housing may be more likely to experience returns to homelessness. Even among

households exiting to permanent destinations, 23.3% exited to rentals without ongoing subsidy. Together, these suggest a need for both affordable housing units, as well as tenant-based rental assistance to support extremely low and low-income households. Moreover, 12.4% of adult leavers in Youngstown exited to temporary stays with friends or family. This “doubled-up” population is particularly at-risk of returning to homelessness and is indicative of a shortage of good housing stock and supportive housing as it is increasingly more difficult to find housing. Stakeholders reported that individuals/households that are “doubled up” often are underserved because their homeless status cannot easily be established for many CoC-funded programs that require a household be homeless in order to receive assistance.

Stakeholders reported that households without ongoing supportive services are more likely to experience crises, unexpected financial obligations, or other obstacles that may lead to returns to homelessness. Services such as case management, financial literacy, budgeting, basic life skills, workforce development and training, childcare and transportation, when provided beyond the time limitations of housing and/or rental assistance, are needed to promote stability and prevent returns to homelessness. Stakeholders reported these long-term services are not widely available due to lack of financial and staff capacity.

**Veterans:** According to HMIS data, during the January 1<sup>st</sup>, 2021-December 31<sup>st</sup>, 2021 period, there were 2 chronically homeless veterans and 14 non-chronically homeless veterans. In the Continuum of Care as a whole, there were 7 chronically homeless veterans and 32 non-chronically homeless veterans. Barriers to accessing resources or difficulties by service providers in engaging veterans may include co-occurring mental health and/or substance abuse disorders, lack of income or rental history, or criminal history. Moreover, stakeholders suggested an increase in the number of homeless female veterans: one of the fastest growing homeless populations, but generally ignored in terms of direct outreach to this sub-population. Female veterans have higher rates of military sexual trauma, which can sometimes make it more difficult for these women to feel willing to identify as a veteran and benefit from supportive services. In addition, stakeholders indicated that the majority of homeless female veterans have children therefore there is a need for more veteran family-friendly housing, especially with services for women who have experienced military sexual trauma. Family and Community Services Inc is a safe haven provider for Mahoning County dedicated to veterans. During the January 1<sup>st</sup>, 2021-December 31<sup>st</sup>, 2021 period, they served 2 chronically homeless veterans.

**Persons with Disabilities:** For people with disabilities, accessible housing is a continuing and critical need, ranging from individuals in wheelchairs to medical beds and in-home healthcare services in order to maintain housing stability. Overall, there is a need for permanent housing that can accommodate persons with disabilities. This typically includes bathrooms equipped with grab bars, installation of handrails, walk-in showers and tubs, along with handicapped accessible doors and cabinets.

**Persons with Substance Abuse Disorders:** In the 2022 PIT, 65 individuals were facing chronic substance abuse disorders, up from 25 in 2021. According to HMIS data, 21 individuals who entered emergency shelter, permanent supportive housing, rapid-rehousing, and transitional housing programs were living in a substance abuse treatment facility or detox center immediately prior to entering the project. Stakeholders expressed a need for more sober housing units and providers. Stakeholders commented on the lack of dedicated housing for those recovering from substance abuse disorders, noting the need for housing that is not in neighborhoods where there are potential triggers for clients and ensuring



supportive services and long-term engagement with the individuals to support long-term recovery. According to one stakeholder, it takes at least a year for a person with addiction for their mind to return to a sense of stability, therefore, 180-day stay limitations on housing programs is not sufficient to meet the needs of persons with substance abuse disorders.

Furthermore, stakeholders addressed the needs of LGBTQA+ individuals within the Continuum of Care, as they particularly struggle with addiction and mental health issues within the community but lack dedicated services for LGBTQA+ individuals.

**Identify any gaps within the current shelter and housing inventory as well as the service delivery system:**

Since PIT and HIC data can only provide a snapshot of persons experiencing homelessness on a single night, a broader picture can be provided through data presented in the City of Youngstown’s Annual Performance Report (APR) for the January 1<sup>st</sup>, 2021-December 31<sup>st</sup>, 2021 period. Across Mahoning County, 728 households stayed at least one night in emergency shelters, permanent supportive housing, rapid re-housing, transitional housing, or safe haven projects.

Exits from the Homeless System – City of Youngstown			
	% Exits to Positive Destinations	# of Households Exited to Positive Destinations	Total # of Households Exited
<i>By Pathway</i>			
Emergency Shelter	48.5%	50	103
Permanent Supportive Housing	91.2%	52	57
Rapid Re-Housing	43.8%	39	89
Transitional Housing	50.0%	5	10
<b>All Households</b>	<b>56.4%</b>	<b>146</b>	<b>259</b>

Source: 2021 APR Data

There continues to be a large gap in the number of quality affordable and accessible units available for rent in the City. Only 56.4% of households exiting the homeless system exited to positive housing destinations. This suggests that there is an overall lack of permanent housing resources. In addition, the number of landlords willing to accept vouchers and work with special needs populations is dwindling due to private landlords selling their units and the ability of landlords to charge rents at a rate that exceeds FMR and/or YMHA Payment Standards. Stakeholders reported that there is insufficient inventory of larger units to accommodate families with 4+ children; households will take a smaller unit and experience overcrowded conditions in order to have a home. Youngstown State University indicated that there is also a gap in available single bedroom units for students experiencing homelessness.

As previously indicated, shelter resources (both bed capacity and staff capacity) are insufficient to meet the needs. Specifically, there is a gap for low-barrier year-round shelter resources.

Moreover, there is a systems barrier when it comes to landlords as it is increasingly more difficult to foster coordination with Youngstown landlords. For example, due to the rigorous inspection requirements pertaining to landlords in the City, in conjunction with the Youngstown housing stock

which is characterized by centennial homes, typically not up-to-code, it is hard to find transitional or permanent housing because of the difficulties and high costs associated with bringing these buildings up to code. Housing units across the board need rehabilitation dollars for landlords in order to increase the quality of the housing stock in Youngstown. Moreover, landlords are hesitant to rent to clients under the voucher program, or are increasing rent or security deposits. Stakeholders suggested that landlords attempt to double the rent while the client is receiving rental assistance, but upon exiting the program and taking over the lease, client can no longer support the costs on their own.

Stakeholders also reported that the ability to provide utility assistance is a gap in the system, particularly for households with large utility arrears that prevent a household from being able to lease a unit and open utilities in their name.

There are barriers to accessing housing for the re-entry/criminal justice involved populations, including their criminal record, ineligibility for permanent housing/HCV, untreated co-occurring mental health/substance misuse disorders, parole. Stakeholders indicated NCS would be beneficial for this population.

Gaps in the service system as identified by stakeholders include services to assist households in crisis address immediate needs are generally unavailable-there is a focus on long term stability rather than addressing the immediate needs. In addition, the availability of case managers during non-traditional hours is a needed service but is generally unavailable.

***Under Section IV.4.2.ii.G of the HOME-ARP Notice, a PJ may provide additional characteristics associated with instability and increased risk of homelessness in their HOME-ARP allocation plan. These characteristics will further refine the definition of “other populations” that are “At Greatest Risk of Housing Instability,” as established in the HOME-ARP Notice. If including these characteristics, identify them here:***

Enter narrative response here.

***Identify priority needs for qualifying populations:***

Based on stakeholder consultations and data analysis, rental housing that is affordable and accessible to individuals and households at 0-30% AMI is a priority need. An adequate inventory of deeply subsidized housing for Qualifying Populations is a priority due to low vacancy rates and escalating rental costs. Coupled with this is a priority for supportive services (including case management, legal services, and homeless prevention services) to assist the homeless in identifying and accessing housing and becoming stably housed, as well as the prevention of homelessness among those households at-risk. Stakeholders also reported the need for low-barrier shelter in the City.

***Explain how the PJ determined the level of need and gaps in the PJ’s shelter and housing inventory and service delivery systems based on the data presented in the plan:***

In addition to feedback from stakeholders and consultation sessions, the following plans and data sources were consulted to determine needs and system gaps for HOME-ARP qualifying populations:

- American Community Survey (ACS), 2016-2020
- HUD Comprehensive Housing Affordability Strategy (CHAS), 2015-2019

- 2022 Point-In-Time Count
- 2022 Housing Inventory County (HIC)
- Coordinated Entry System (CES)
- Youngstown/Mahoning County CoC Annual Performance Report (APR)
- 2021 System Performance Measures
- Compass Family Services data (DV Provider)

## HOME-ARP Activities

***Describe the method(s) that will be used for soliciting applications for funding and/or selecting developers, service providers, subrecipients and/or contractors:***

The City of Youngstown Community Development Division will invite any Developer/Owner or non-profit entity that is looking to apply for funding and/or other resources from the City for the new construction or substantial rehabilitation of non-congregate shelter to submit a proposal for funding. The proposed activity, including the proposed qualifying population(s) to be served, will be evaluated in accordance with the City's HOME-ARP allocation priorities, preferences and prioritization (if any), and projects that address qualifying populations will be considered. The City is not currently establishing preference or priority as part of its scoring criteria for HOME ARP proposals for funding. Should the City establish preference or priorities, a substantial amendment may be duly publicized and submitted to HUD for review. Developers, service providers or subrecipients applying for HOME-ARP must meet the minimum program eligibility and threshold requirements. Depending on the nature of the proposed activity, site inspections may be conducted by City staff. An evaluation of the site's feasibility, financial underwriting and developer capacity assessment will be completed and considered as part of the review process.

***Describe whether the PJ will administer eligible activities directly:***

The City of Youngstown will not administer and oversee its eligible activities directly. Rather, it will enter into HOME Agreements with developers of non-congregate shelter, and execute subrecipient agreements with service providers who may receive funding.

***If any portion of the PJ's HOME-ARP administrative funds are provided to a subrecipient or contractor prior to HUD's acceptance of the HOME-ARP allocation plan because the subrecipient or contractor is responsible for the administration of the PJ's entire HOME-ARP grant, identify the subrecipient or contractor and describe its role and responsibilities in administering all of the PJ's HOME-ARP program:***

The City of Youngstown will not be distributing any portion of its HOME – ARP administrative funds to a subrecipient or contractor prior to HUD's acceptance of the HOME-ARP allocation plan.

### Use of HOME-ARP Funding

	Funding Amount	Percent of the Grant	Statutory Limit
Supportive Services	\$ 500,000		
Acquisition and Development of Non-Congregate Shelters	\$ 1,638,891		
Tenant Based Rental Assistance (TBRA)	\$ 0		
Development of Affordable Rental Housing	\$ 0	0%	0
Non-Profit Operating	\$ 0	0 %	0%
Non-Profit Capacity Building	\$ 0	0 %	0%
Administration and Planning	\$ 377,451	0 %	0%

Total HOME ARP Allocation	\$ 2,516,342		
---------------------------	--------------	--	--

***Describe how the PJ will distribute HOME-ARP funds in accordance with its priority needs identified in its needs assessment and gap analysis:***

An overall lack of affordable rental units was one of the most frequently identified unmet needs among stakeholders. However, the amount of funding available to the City for creating additional affordable inventory units would limit the benefit of the HOME-ARP funding to a very small number of QP households. The need for shelter, particularly low-barrier shelter, was often cited during the consultation process. The City will utilize its HOME-ARP resources to create a centralized, non-congregate shelter that also offers robust supportive services to increase the permanent housing success of the qualifying populations.

***Describe how the characteristics of the shelter and housing inventory, service delivery system, and the needs identified in the gap analysis provided a rationale for the plan to fund eligible activities:***

Shelters lack bed capacity for households experiencing homelessness, primarily because it is increasingly challenging to move folks out of shelter into permanent housing due to lack of affordable inventory. The City recognizes that even with additional affordable inventory, the lack of low-barrier shelter options within the City will mean continued increases in unsheltered individuals, as immediate shelter is often not available. In addition, if directed to the development of additional affordable inventory, the HOME-ARP resources available to the City will benefit only a small portion of the qualifying populations. Therefore, the City’s emphasis with HOME ARP funds will be on the development of noncongregate shelter options, coupled with supportive services such as case management and system navigation to address immediate needs and plan for medium-long term stability, to increase and encourage success in permanent housing.

## HOME-ARP Production Housing Goals

***Estimate the number of affordable rental housing units for qualifying populations that the PJ will produce or support with its HOME-ARP allocation:***

The City is not proposing the production of affordable units with HOME ARP funds.

***Describe the specific affordable rental housing production goal that the PJ hopes to achieve and describe how the production goal will address the PJ's priority needs:***

The City is not proposing the production of affordable units with HOME ARP funds.

## Preferences

***Identify whether the PJ intends to give preference to one or more qualifying populations or a subpopulation within one or more qualifying populations for any eligible activity or project:***

The City of Youngstown will not establish a preference; all qualifying populations will be eligible to apply for assistance under the City's HOME-ARP assisted program(s). Any preferences established in the future will be described in an amendment to this Allocation Plan and will not violate any fair housing, civil rights, or nondiscrimination requirements at the federal, state, or local level, which includes but is not limited to requirements found in 24 CFR 5.105(a).

***If a preference was identified, explain how the use of a preference or method of prioritization will address the unmet need or gap in benefits and services received by individuals and families in the qualifying population or subpopulation of qualifying population, consistent with the PJ's needs assessment and gap analysis:***

No preferences are established.

## Referral Methods

*Identify the referral methods that the PJ intends to use for its HOME-ARP projects and activities. PJ's may use multiple referral methods in its HOME-ARP program. (Optional):*

Expanding the Coordinated Entry System in Mahoning County/City of Youngstown is an infeasible option to allow for direct referral to HOME-ARP projects. As such, the CE will be one method of referral through which the City can use CE for certain QPs and supplement this with referrals from other agencies to ensure access to all QPs.

*If the PJ intends to use the coordinated entry (CE) process established by the CoC, describe whether all qualifying populations eligible for a project or activity will be included in the CE process, or the method by which all qualifying populations eligible for the project or activity will be covered. (Optional):*

As indicated above Coordinated Entry will not be used to admit applicants directly to a HOME-ARP assisted project as it does not include all of the qualifying populations. Referrals will be accepted from other sources including 2-1-1, Street Outreach programs and service providers.

*If the PJ intends to use the CE process established by the CoC, describe the method of prioritization to be used by the CE. (Optional):*

As indicated above Coordinated Entry will not be used to admit applicants directly to a HOME-ARP assisted project, and the CoC CE prioritization will not be utilized to admit qualifying populations to directly projects.

*If the PJ intends to use both a CE process established by the CoC and another referral method for a project or activity, describe any method of prioritization between the two referral methods, if any. (Optional):*

As indicated above Coordinated Entry will not be used to admit applicants directly to a HOME-ARP assisted project as it does not include all of the qualifying populations. Referrals will be accepted from other sources including 2-1-1, Street Outreach programs and service providers.



## Limitations in a HOME-ARP rental housing or NCS project

***Describe whether the PJ intends to limit eligibility for a HOME-ARP rental housing or NCS project to a particular qualifying population or specific subpopulation of a qualifying population identified in section IV.A of the Notice:***

The City of Youngstown is not establishing limitations on eligibility in HOME-ARP NCS.

***If a PJ intends to implement a limitation, explain why the use of a limitation is necessary to address the unmet need or gap in benefits and services received by individuals and families in the qualifying population or subpopulation of qualifying population, consistent with the PJ's needs assessment and gap analysis:***

The City of Youngstown is not establishing limitations on eligibility in HOME-ARP NCS.

***If a limitation was identified, describe how the PJ will address the unmet needs or gaps in benefits and services of the other qualifying populations that are not included in the limitation through the use of HOME-ARP funds (i.e., through another of the PJ's HOME-ARP projects or activities):***

Not applicable.

## HOME-ARP Refinancing Guidelines

The City of Youngstown does not intend to use HOME-ARP funds to refinance existing debt secured by multifamily rental housing in order to rehabilitate the units with HOME-ARP funds. If the City determines that it will use HOME ARP for refinancing, the guidelines for doing so will be in conformance with the HOME-ARP program notice and will be submitted to HUD for review.

Appendix A: Consultation Appendix

Appendix B: Citizen Participation

Appendix C: SF424s/Certifications