

# FY 2023 Comprehensive Annual Performance & Evaluation Report (CAPER)

---

CITY OF YOUNGSTOWN | DRAFT FOR DISPLAY - SEPTEMBER 10 -25, 2024

Prepared by:

CITY OF YOUNGSTOWN | MULLIN & LONERGAN ASSOCIATES, INC.

## CR-05 - Goals and Outcomes

### **Progress the jurisdiction has made in carrying out its strategic plan and its action plan. 91.520(a)**

This could be an overview that includes major initiatives and highlights that were proposed and executed throughout the program year.

The Housing and Community Development Act of 1974, as amended, requires all Community Development (CDBG) and HOME entitlement programs to prepare and submit a Consolidated Annual Performance and Evaluation Report (CAPER) to the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) at the close of each program year. The City of Youngstown is an entitlement community for this program, as designated by HUD, and receives an annual allocation of CDBG funds. The CAPER provides the City of Youngstown and interested stakeholders with the opportunity to evaluate the progress in carrying out priorities and objectives contained in the City's five-year plan.

The progress described in this report illustrates Youngstown's efforts to utilize CDBG funding and enhance coordination with Community Development programs to create a more vibrant and livable community and improve the quality of life for low-income citizens in Youngstown. Our team continued to prioritize the needs of the community while utilizing CDBG funds to forward the City's Strategic Plan goals and objectives.

This is the fourth report for the five-year Consolidated Plan period, which began July 1, 2020, and continues through June 30, 2025. The annual allocation for PY2023 (July 1, 2023 – June 30, 2024) were as follows:

CDBG: \$3,425,697

HOME: \$770,649

ESG: \$306,074

A review of activities undertaken during the program year finds that in all cases CDBG, HOME, and ESG dollars were used to address the objectives and related priorities in the Five-Year Consolidated Plan. Details on all HUD expenditures and beneficiaries are provided in HUD's Integrated Disbursement Information System (IDIS). As part of leveraging, other federally funded, non-federally funded, housing-related activities are included in this CAPER.

The primary uses of the CDBG funds were owner-occupied housing rehabilitation through emergency and limited repairs, public facility and infrastructure improvements, and public services directed toward youth services and crime reduction. These programs

meet the high priority needs of Youngstown and are consistent with program objectives. YNDC provided repair services for 246 income-eligible owner-occupied housing units with the intent to improve property values, discourage further vacancies, and improve the quality of life for the area residents.

To help stabilize neighborhoods community policing was used to reduce crime, housing assistance was provided to help low-income homeowners in meeting housing standards, blighting influences were removed, and public improvements were made to streets and sidewalks in neighborhoods.

Public facility and infrastructure improvements include updating fire department equipment, street resurfacing, neighborhood beautification through streetscape improvements to reduce blight. These projects were determined to be high priorities based on city resident input.

Funds from the HOME program were primarily used for owner-occupied housing rehabilitation. BNOY and YNDC rehabilitated single-family homes for households with incomes between 0-80% AMI.

Emergency Solutions Grants subrecipients include Catholic Charities Regional Agency, COMPASS Family and Community Services, Help Hotline Crisis Center, and Beatitude Ursuline Center Merici Housing. These organizations provided homeless prevention services, rapid rehousing, and emergency shelter.

**Comparison of the proposed versus actual outcomes for each outcome measure submitted with the consolidated plan and explain, if applicable, why progress was not made toward meeting goals and objectives. 91.520(g)**

Categories, priority levels, funding sources and amounts, outcomes/objectives, goal outcome indicators, units of measure, targets, actual outcomes/outputs, and percentage completed for each of the grantee's program year goals.

Goal	Category	Source / Amount	Indicator	Unit of Measure	Expected – Strategic Plan	Actual – Strategic Plan	Percent Complete	Expected – Program Year	Actual – Program Year	Percent Complete
Assist in creating economic opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	75	174	232.00%			
Assist in creating economic opportunities	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Jobs created/retained	Jobs	0	0				
Assist public service providers	Non-Homeless Special Needs	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	21085	6610	31.35%	10050	0	0.00%
Blight removal	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	0	0		13204	0	0.00%
Blight removal	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	61250	49335	80.55%			

Blight removal	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	0	13				
Grant administration	Admin	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	0	0		1	0	0.00%
Housing/services to the homeless and near-homeless	Homeless	ESG: \$	Homeless Person Overnight Shelter	Persons Assisted	0	550		54	0	0.00%
Housing/services to the homeless and near-homeless	Homeless	ESG: \$	Homelessness Prevention	Persons Assisted	5065	3176	62.70%	155	0	0.00%
Improve quality of existing housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	0	0				
Improve quality of existing housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Rental units rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	930	46	4.95%			
Improve quality of existing housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Homeowner Housing Rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	1785	561	31.43%	157	152	96.82%
Improve quality of existing housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$ / HOME: \$	Other	Other	0	0				

Increase supply of housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$50000 / HOME: \$	Rental units rehabilitated	Household Housing Unit	0	0		4	0	0.00%
Increase supply of housing	Affordable Housing	CDBG: \$50000 / HOME: \$	Homeowner Housing Added	Household Housing Unit	5	3	60.00%			
Public facility improvements	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	623600	81445	13.06%	60068	0	0.00%
Public infrastructure improvements	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public Facility or Infrastructure Activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	109000	99585	91.36%	60068	0	0.00%
Reduce crime	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Public service activities other than Low/Moderate Income Housing Benefit	Persons Assisted	300000	110660	36.89%	24380	0	0.00%
Repayment of Section 108 Loans	Non-Housing Community Development	CDBG: \$	Other	Other	0	0		1	0	0.00%

**Table 1 - Accomplishments – Program Year & Strategic Plan to Date**

**Assess how the jurisdiction’s use of funds, particularly CDBG, addresses the priorities and specific objectives identified in the plan, giving special attention to the highest priority activities identified.**

In the City of Youngstown, the Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) funds were strategically allocated to address critical needs and enhance the quality of life for the City's low- and moderate-income (LMI) populations, resulting in a series of impactful changes throughout the community. The primary objective of the consolidated plan and the action plan is neighborhood stabilization. The City's strategic use of CDBG funds has been instrumental in stabilizing and revitalizing its neighborhoods. With a focus on addressing both immediate needs and long-term improvements, these funds are allocated to various projects aimed at strengthening community infrastructure and enhancing residents' quality of life.

One notable initiative involves the rehabilitation of distressed housing. By using CDBG funds to repair and improve properties, Youngstown is not only making homes safer and more livable but also boosting property values and attracting new residents. This effort helps to counteract the effects of blight and abandonment, fostering a more stable and attractive neighborhood environment.

Other significant initiatives that met the strategic planning goals include assisting public service providers, blight removal, improving quality of housing, public facility improvements, public infrastructure improvements, and reducing crime.

**CR-10 - Racial and Ethnic composition of families assisted**

Describe the families assisted (including the racial and ethnic status of families assisted).

91.520(a)

	<b>CDBG</b>	<b>HOME</b>
White	1,259	6
Black or African American	2,315	1
Asian	4	0
American Indian or American Native	8	0
Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander	1	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>3,587</b>	<b>7</b>
Hispanic	322	5
Not Hispanic	3,265	2

Describe the clients assisted (including the racial and/or ethnicity of clients assisted with ESG)

	<b>HESG</b>
American Indian, Alaska Native, or Indigenous	0
Asian or Asian American	0
Black, African American, or African	0
Hispanic/Latina/e/o	0
Middle Eastern or North African	0
Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander	0
White	0
Multiracial	0
Client doesn't know	0
Client prefers not to answer	0
Data not collected	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>

**Table 2 – Table of assistance to racial and ethnic populations by source of funds**

**Narrative**

The U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) requires grantees to collect detailed race and ethnicity data using nine categories, as well as Hispanic/Latino ethnicity. This ensures that housing programs and services are being distributed fairly and equitably. Youngstown requires sub-grantees/sub-recipients/public agencies to collect this data when completing activities utilizing federal



funding.

The table above includes both families and individuals. Individuals who self-identify as “multiple races, “refused to answer or did not know their race or ethnicity or did not have their information collected are included in the “Other” category but are not included in the total number of families assisted. The comprehensive data listed in the table does, however, show that services provided benefited the city's most economically and socially disadvantaged residents.

## CR-15 - Resources and Investments 91.520(a)

### Identify the resources made available

Source of Funds	Source	Resources Made Available	Amount Expended During Program Year
CDBG	public - federal	3,425,697	3,169,999.30
HOME	public - federal	770,649	171,073.00
ESG	public - federal	306,074	175,095.21

**Table 3 - Resources Made Available**

### Narrative

The City of Youngstown solicits application from Non-profit organizations and local governments that deliver services to low-income clients within the City of Youngstown's service area may apply for funding. To receive consideration for funding through the City of Youngstown, all non-profit organizations must have their non-profit status and the supporting documentation from the IRS at the time of application. Organizations must demonstrate financial viability to operate a federally funded program on a reimbursement basis and have no real or perceived conflict of interest.

The review process for proposals requesting grant funds consists of a review by City staff and a committee that includes specified City Council members. The staff review verifies that the proposal is one that includes an eligible activity as determined by HUD guidelines. The staff will further evaluate proposals based on information provided in the submitted application. Final awards are available for a 30-day public comment period. Once HUD approves the plan and releases funding, a funding agreement between the City of Youngstown and the subrecipient will be executed.

### Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments

Target Area	Planned Percentage of Allocation	Actual Percentage of Allocation	Narrative Description
CITY OF YOUNGSTOWN	100		

**Table 4 – Identify the geographic distribution and location of investments**

### Narrative

All funding was expended in the target area, which is defined as the City of Youngstown.

## Leveraging

**Explain how federal funds leveraged additional resources (private, state and local funds), including a description of how matching requirements were satisfied, as well as how any publicly owned land or property located within the jurisdiction that were used to address the needs identified in the plan.**

Federal funds have played a crucial role in leveraging additional resources in Youngstown through various programs and initiatives aimed at boosting local development and addressing community needs. This is particularly true with respect to development projects, as very rarely do Federal resources cover all the costs, particularly if the project is more than 2-3 units in size. Federal funds have supported strategic planning efforts, which, in turn, makes the community more attractive to additional funders and investors who are interested in building on these planning efforts. The City of Youngstown has been exempt from the HOME match requirement since 2003.

<b>Fiscal Year Summary – HOME Match</b>	
1. Excess match from prior Federal fiscal year	0
2. Match contributed during current Federal fiscal year	0
3. Total match available for current Federal fiscal year (Line 1 plus Line 2)	0
4. Match liability for current Federal fiscal year	0
5. Excess match carried over to next Federal fiscal year (Line 3 minus Line 4)	0

**Table 5 – Fiscal Year Summary - HOME Match Report**

Match Contribution for the Federal Fiscal Year								
Project No. or Other ID	Date of Contribution	Cash (non-Federal sources)	Foregone Taxes, Fees, Charges	Appraised Land/Real Property	Required Infrastructure	Site Preparation, Construction Materials, Donated labor	Bond Financing	Total Match

Table 6 – Match Contribution for the Federal Fiscal Year

**HOME MBE/WBE report**

Program Income – Enter the program amounts for the reporting period				
Balance on hand at begin-ning of reporting period \$	Amount received during reporting period \$	Total amount expended during reporting period \$	Amount expended for TBRA \$	Balance on hand at end of reporting period \$
0	0	0	0	0

Table 7 – Program Income

<b>Minority Business Enterprises and Women Business Enterprises – Indicate the number and dollar value of contracts for HOME projects completed during the reporting period</b>						
	Total	Minority Business Enterprises				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
<b>Contracts</b>						
Number	46	0	0	0	7	39
Dollar Amount	\$563,600.60	0	0	0	\$74,449	\$489,151.60
<b>Sub-Contracts</b>						
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0
	Total	Women Business Enterprises	Male			
<b>Contracts</b>						
Number	46	6	40			
Dollar Amount	\$563,600.60	\$285,540	\$278,060.60			
<b>Sub-Contracts</b>						
Number	0	0	0			
Dollar Amount	0	0	0			

**Table 8 - Minority Business and Women Business Enterprises**

<b>Minority Owners of Rental Property – Indicate the number of HOME assisted rental property owners and the total amount of HOME funds in these rental properties assisted</b>						
	Total	Minority Property Owners				White Non-Hispanic
		Alaskan Native or American Indian	Asian or Pacific Islander	Black Non-Hispanic	Hispanic	
Number	0	0	0	0	0	0
Dollar Amount	0	0	0	0	0	0

**Table 9 – Minority Owners of Rental Property**

<b>Relocation and Real Property Acquisition</b> – Indicate the number of persons displaced, the cost of relocation payments, the number of parcels acquired, and the cost of acquisition						
Parcels Acquired		<b>0</b>		<b>0</b>		
Businesses Displaced		<b>0</b>		<b>0</b>		
Nonprofit Organizations Displaced		<b>0</b>		<b>0</b>		
Households Temporarily Relocated, not Displaced		<b>0</b>		<b>0</b>		
<b>Households Displaced</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>Minority Property Enterprises</b>				<b>White Non-Hispanic</b>
		<b>Alaskan Native or American Indian</b>	<b>Asian or Pacific Islander</b>	<b>Black Non-Hispanic</b>	<b>Hispanic</b>	
Number	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
Cost	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>

**Table 10 – Relocation and Real Property Acquisition**

## CR-20 - Affordable Housing 91.520(b)

Evaluation of the jurisdiction's progress in providing affordable housing, including the number and types of families served, the number of extremely low-income, low-income, moderate-income, and middle-income persons served.

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	0	0
Number of Non-Homeless households to be provided affordable housing units	161	65
Number of Special-Needs households to be provided affordable housing units	0	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>161</b>	<b>0</b>

Table 11 – Number of Households

	One-Year Goal	Actual
Number of households supported through Rental Assistance	0	0
Number of households supported through The Production of New Units	0	0
Number of households supported through Rehab of Existing Units	159	246
Number of households supported through Acquisition of Existing Units	2	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>161</b>	<b>0</b>

Table 12 – Number of Households Supported

**Discuss the difference between goals and outcomes and problems encountered in meeting these goals.**

The bulk of rehabilitated housing units was provided using CDBG funds through limited, emergency, and roof repairs on 113 homeowner-occupied units conducted by YNDC. The production of new units and acquisition of existing units is underway but wasn't completed in PY 2023.

**Discuss how these outcomes will impact future annual action plans.**

As the City of Youngstown advances toward its goals of enhancing affordable housing and

improving infrastructure, these efforts will significantly shape its future action plans and overall development strategy.

Youngstown’s focus on expanding affordable housing will drive future action plans by setting a foundation for broader community stability and growth. Investments in new housing projects and the rehabilitation of existing properties will address critical needs, promote neighborhood revitalization, and attract residents. This commitment will inform future planning by identifying areas requiring targeted development, ensuring that housing solutions are integrated with other urban initiatives, and establishing benchmarks for success in housing stability and community engagement.

The city’s infrastructure enhancement efforts will similarly influence its future action plans. Upgrading roads, utilities, and public facilities will create a more conducive environment for economic activity and residential growth. Improved infrastructure will support more efficient transportation and a higher quality of public spaces, which will, in turn, drive new development projects and investments. Future plans will need to align with these infrastructure improvements, ensuring that growth is sustainable and that new developments are adequately supported by modernized systems.

By addressing these critical areas, Youngstown is laying the groundwork for a more cohesive and resilient urban strategy. The focus on affordable housing and infrastructure will not only meet immediate needs but also provide a framework for future growth, making the city a more attractive and viable place for residents and businesses alike.

**Include the number of extremely low-income, low-income, and moderate-income persons served by each activity where information on income by family size is required to determine the eligibility of the activity.**

<b>Number of Households Served</b>	<b>CDBG Actual</b>	<b>HOME Actual</b>
Extremely Low-income	111	3
Low-income	55	2
Moderate-income	0	1
<b>Total</b>	<b>166</b>	<b>6</b>

**Table 13 – Number of Households Served**

**Narrative Information**

The number of extremely low-income, low-income, and moderate-income persons served by each activity were derived from PR 03 Activity Summary Report for CDBG activities and PR 23 Summary of Accomplishments for HOME activities.



## **CR-25 - Homeless and Other Special Needs 91.220(d, e); 91.320(d, e); 91.520(c)**

**Evaluate the jurisdiction's progress in meeting its specific objectives for reducing and ending homelessness through:**

### **Reaching out to homeless persons (especially unsheltered persons) and assessing their individual needs**

In Youngstown, the City's collaboration with the Mahoning County Homeless Continuum of Care (MCHCoC) has significantly enhanced its approach to homeless outreach and support. By leveraging Continuum of Care's extensive network and resources, Youngstown has been able to implement more coordinated and comprehensive strategies for addressing homelessness. MCHCoC has a PATH Homeless Outreach Team that focuses on providing essential services and support to individuals experiencing homelessness. The Outreach Team also drives to different areas to talk with businesses about any homeless persons they may encounter. The team frequently goes to the emergency shelter and the local dining halls. While at these locations, they meet with the staff to discuss any persons the team has not met with yet. Street outreach is not funded using ESG funding.

### **Addressing the emergency shelter and transitional housing needs of homeless persons**

The City works closely with various local agencies, non-profits, and community organizations to coordinate efforts and maximize resources. This collaborative approach ensures a comprehensive support system, with services tailored to individual needs and effective referral networks to connect people with long-term housing solutions. Over the past program year, the City of Youngstown allocated ESG resources to several homeless service activities including homeless prevention, rapid re-housing, emergency shelter, and mediation services. Youth and victims of domestic violence shelters are included in these activities. Rescue Mission of the Mahoning Valley operates the County's largest shelter. Youngstown also has a domestic violence shelter through Sojourner House, a youth shelter through Daybreak Youth Crisis Center, and limited transitional housing options.

### **Helping low-income individuals and families avoid becoming homeless, especially extremely low-income individuals and families and those who are: likely to become homeless after being discharged from publicly funded institutions and systems of care (such as health care facilities, mental health facilities, foster care and other youth facilities, and corrections programs and institutions); and, receiving assistance from public or private agencies that address housing, health, social services, employment, education, or youth needs**

There are two homeless prevention programs in Mahoning County. One provides financial assistance for back payment of utilities and assistance with rent, so a person is not evicted. The

second program is a mediation service that works with tenants and landlords to prevent an eviction. Other local agencies, such as MYCAP are also able to assist with monetary assistance. Programs, such as Home for Good, help re-integrate justice-involved individuals into society and include providing assistance in finding housing.

It is the responsibility of the recipients of Emergency Solutions Grand funds and of recipients of CoC Program funds that are state and local governments to establish and implement discharge policies that prevent people from being discharged from publicly funded systems of care into homelessness. These publicly funded systems of care include health and mental health care institutions, correctional facilities, and foster care. These systems of care are also subject to various other federal, state, and local regulations and policies that require them to develop discharge plans for people exiting their care.

It is the Continuum of Care's responsibility to coordinated with and/or assist in state and local discharge planning efforts in order to provide those persons responsibility for discharge planning at the state and local government levels the benefit of the Continuum's experience in and knowledge of homelessness. MCHCoC will carry out its responsibility to collaborate with the above-named systems of care by:

1. Providing them with information about housing options available to people being discharged from their care, including information about the Youngstown Metropolitan Housing Authority, other low-income housing projects, programs providing rental assistance, and if necessary, as a last resort, shelter information;
2. Inviting representatives of these systems of care to MCHCoC member meetings and notifying them of other opportunities to connect and collaborate with individuals and agencies addressing housing issues; and
1. Contributing information these systems need when applying for funding to meet the housing needs of those being discharged from their care and providing letters of support for such applications.

**Helping homeless persons (especially chronically homeless individuals and families, families with children, veterans and their families, and unaccompanied youth) make the transition to permanent housing and independent living, including shortening the period of time that individuals and families experience homelessness, facilitating access for homeless individuals and families to affordable housing units, and preventing individuals and families who were recently homeless from becoming homeless again**

The MCHCoC is responsible for helping homeless persons (especially chronically homeless individuals and families, families with children, veterans and their families, and unaccompanied youth) make the transition to permanent housing and independent living. This includes shortening the period of time that individuals and families experience homelessness, facilitating

access for homeless individuals and families to affordable housing units, and preventing individuals and families who were recently homeless from becoming homeless again.

The MCHCoC completed its strategic plan in August 2019. An area that the MCHCoC will address in the strategic plan is the length of time a person is homeless. Leaders in the MCHCoC reviewed information from ten community interviews; tours of housing assistance projects; data on homeless trends, system performance, project performance, funding sources and recipients, and Coordinated Entry (CE) to create a more efficient, effective, and successful system. Overall, the plan addresses the need to shift focus on providing long-term housing by focusing Rapid Rehousing and permanent supportive housing while increasing the capacity of homeless service providers and the coordinated entry system. MCHCoC continued to follow this strategic plan for PY2023.

## **CR-30 - Public Housing 91.220(h); 91.320(j)**

### **Actions taken to address the needs of public housing**

Part of YMHA's strategy to improving the living environment of low- and moderate-income households is through Rental Assistance Demonstration (RAD). RAD converts HUD-assisted properties to project-based Section 8 contracts, which YMHA has an additional capacity for. This allows these properties to secure capital and other resources that are restricted under public housing, safeguarding long-term rental units by maintaining them in good condition. YMHA formed an internal RAD taskforce in 2019, training staff on operation requirements and the impacts of RAD conversions. The 150-unit Gutknecht Towers continues to be the largest priority for RAD conversion, with Arlington Heights and the Village at Arlington also being considered.

Additionally, YMHA continues to operate its EnVision Center. The program serves to empower households to become self-sufficient through on-site services, including opportunities to provided additional economic, educational, health, and leadership opportunities. It is located at their Rockford Village site, holding family and youth programs for residents. In 2022, the EnVision Center partnered with 19 community partners and provided 25 programs to the Rockford Community. Youth programs included education/tutoring, sports leagues, Girl Scouts, and a library. Adult services included job readiness/job placement, job fairs, nutrition/cooking classes, and parenting support. Services for families included health/dental screenings, fire awareness, neighborhood safety awareness, community fun days, and a pop-up fresh produce market.

### **Actions taken to encourage public housing residents to become more involved in management and participate in homeownership**

Each property managed by YMHA has a Residents' Council to provide input on the needs of residents and assist in decision-making. YMHA will continue to promote programs, and expand its efforts, to encourage resident involvement and homeownership opportunities.

### **Actions taken to provide assistance to troubled PHAs**

The Youngstown Metropolitan Housing Authority is not a troubled PHA; therefore, no action was taken.

## **CR-35 - Other Actions 91.220(j)-(k); 91.320(i)-(j)**

**Actions taken to remove or ameliorate the negative effects of public policies that serve as barriers to affordable housing such as land use controls, tax policies affecting land, zoning ordinances, building codes, fees and charges, growth limitations, and policies affecting the return on residential investment. 91.220 (j); 91.320 (i)**

In November 2020, Youngstown Neighborhood Development Corporation prepared a Housing Conditions Analysis and Strategy to Improve Housing Conditions in partnership with the City of Youngstown and Youngstown State University. The document serves as a key piece in understanding the contributing factors to Youngstown's poor housing conditions and guide stakeholders and decision makers to more effectively coordinate efforts to address local housing needs.

Strategies related to public policy that the City is evaluating feasibility of in the near future include:

- Establish a financial sustainable, performance-based rental licensing and inspection regime to incentivize good landlords and penalize those not in compliance.
- Improve code enforcement tools to address nuisance properties
- Elimination of spot zoning
- Aggressively assist low-income homeowners with home improvements and emergency repairs, as is currently done using CDBG funds.
- Develop and incentivize homebuyers through free housing counseling for potential home buyers and existing homeowners and stronger relationships with banks to improve access to credit and down payment assistance.
- Extend the Community Reinvestment Area to cover the entire City of Youngstown
- Assign project-based HCVs to housing development projects
- Strategically assemble land and buildings with potential for redevelopment or reuse as housing
- Establish a Housing Trust Fund

## **Actions taken to address obstacles to meeting underserved needs. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)**

Youngstown's collaborative approach among various social service agencies has significantly improved support for underserved populations. The City continued to allocate funding to agencies that offer needed services such as health care, re-entry resource services, and youth programs. These agencies are centrally located and easily accessed by residents who may face barriers such as lack of transportation. Activities in 2023 that focused on meeting underserved needs include:

- Assisting 113 formerly incarcerated individuals become self-sustaining through the Home for Good Re-Entry Resource Referral Center
- Exposing 78 City youths to multiple career paths, entrepreneurship, and college acceptance requirements through Inspiring Minds Youngstown's Enrichment Program

- Offering free classes in visual arts, music, dance, theater, and creative writing year-round for 156 students grades PK-12 through SMARTS public programming
- Assisting 274 residents develop professional skills necessary to become marketable for employment through Flying High Inc's Professional Development Center
- Provide educational workshops for 490 students including cultural activities, career and college fairs, recreation, field trips, summer camp, and a new Mental Health Navigator Project through the OCCHA, Inc. Youth Outreach Program
- Exposing 137 City youths to a broad array of entrepreneurial activities through YBI's Youth Entrepreneurship Program

By pooling resources and expertise, they address a range of needs from educational support to affordable housing and employment services. This network of cooperation has been instrumental in transforming how services are delivered and ensuring that underserved populations receive the support they need.

**Actions taken to reduce lead-based paint hazards. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)**

Youngstown provides matching funding to the Mahoning County Lead-Based Paint Hazard Control Program, which serves to make housing units lead safe use a combination of interim controls and lead abatement techniques to reduce environmental health issues in housing. The department administers the State of Ohio's Community Housing Improvement Program for the region to address LBP hazards through repairs and rehabilitation. The Lead Hazard Control Program partners with local hospitals to coordinate screening children and training/educating parents regarding lead and healthy homes issues. All housing rehab projects funded with CDBG or HOME funding conducted by contractors are required to adhere to all applicable lead requirements.

**Actions taken to reduce the number of poverty-level families. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)**

The City has implemented targeted programs that include expanding access to affordable housing, enhancing educational opportunities, and providing comprehensive job training services. Local agencies collaborate closely with nonprofits to offer financial literacy programs and emergency assistance, helping families achieve greater financial stability. Actions and programs to reduce poverty are focused on retaining and growing local business opportunities along with providing education and job skills training to low- and moderate-income households. Additionally, many businesses are incentivized to hire low-income individuals through grants loans or tax abatements. The accomplishments of these actions overlap with meeting the underserved needs of Youngstown residents.

**Actions taken to develop institutional structure. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)**

The City contributed to developing institutional structure by working closely with regional organizations, including the Mahoning County Homeless Continuum of Care, Eastgate Regional Council of Governments, the Regional Chamber of Commerce, the Western Reserve Port Authority and the Mahoning Rivers Mayors Association. These organizations or consulted with in determining project priorities for activities funded through CDBG and ESG.

**Actions taken to enhance coordination between public and private housing and social service agencies. 91.220(k); 91.320(j)**

The City of Youngstown will continue to assist and work with the Mahoning County Homeless CoC, non-profit and private developers, and private industry in a cooperative effort to maximize resources directed to affordable housing. The development of this type of relationship will strengthen coordination between the City, the community, and prospective developers in pursuit of affordable housing construction and rehabilitation. The City will also continue to collaborate with local social service agencies to maximize efforts directed to the expansion of affordable housing and supportive services.

**Identify actions taken to overcome the effects of any impediments identified in the jurisdictions analysis of impediments to fair housing choice. 91.520(a)**

In accordance with the AI, fair housing training will continue to be offered through the YMHA Homebuyers Club, a collaboration between the PHA, the City's Human Relations Commission, PNC Bank, and other realtors. Topics covered include the homeownership process, spotting, and reporting discrimination, protected classes, home financing, credit repair, and predatory lending. Since 2016, the YMHA Homebuyers Club has offered eight training sessions each year. YMHA will also continue providing briefings to public housing and HCV holders on fair housing.

The City's Human Relations Commission acts as the fair housing agency to receive and coordinate investigations of fair housing complaints from citizens. The Commission's staff continued to use test subjects to conduct random surveys of rental and for sale properties to determine if entities are complying with fair housing laws.

## **CR-40 - Monitoring 91.220 and 91.230**

**Describe the standards and procedures used to monitor activities carried out in furtherance of the plan and used to ensure long-term compliance with requirements of the programs involved, including minority business outreach and the comprehensive planning requirements**

This monitoring plan is a system the City of Youngstown Department of Community Planning and Economic Development (CPED, on behalf of the City of Youngstown) uses to monitor its Community Development Block Grant Program subrecipient agencies to evaluate program and financial compliance. Activities are monitored to access compliance with Department of Housing and Urban Development regulations and the agreement terms, conditions, and policies set by the City of Youngstown.

**Authority:** Title I of the Housing and Community Development Act of 1974, as amended (42 U.S.C. 5300-5320); sec. 7(d), Department of Housing and Urban Development Act. (42 U.S.C. 3535(d)). Monitoring is an ongoing process of reviewing performance. The CPED monitors use the subrecipient agency data to make judgments about program and financial performance and to assist the subrecipient in improving performance.

The contract compliance monitoring performed by the CPED is different from an annual audit. Monitoring is not an audit of the agency, but rather a focused examination of a specific CDBG-funded activity.

CPED may conduct an annual or an as-needed on-site monitoring visit. CPED will contact the agency to arrange for a monitoring visit. The agency will be informed in writing regarding the initial records to be reviewed. The subrecipient should have records ready for review and a working space set up before the CPED monitor's arrival. CPED nevertheless, conducts quarterly remote or desktop monitoring of all block grant funded activities. Each funded agency is required to submit a quarterly program/financial performance report on October 15, January 15, April 15, and July 15 of the current program year. Each funded agency must also submit an annual program/financial performance report by July 20 of the current program year.

### **Program Monitoring Goals:**

1. To conduct a thorough risk analysis of each subrecipient agency to determine if services are being delivered in accordance with the Agreement between the subrecipient and City of Youngstown. An additional goal of the risk analysis is to determine the need for training and/or technical assistance and the frequency of training conducted for subrecipient agencies.
2. To monitor the scope and focus of services, type of services, number of units, and intended beneficiaries.
3. To review records of subrecipient agencies to determine if systems are in place to properly document the provision of services, client eligibility, and compliance with any other agreement conditions and requirements.



**Financial Monitoring Goals:**

1. To review subrecipient agencies to determine if costs are being expended in accordance with approved budget and other agreement conditions and requirements.
2. To review records of subrecipient agencies to determine if systems are in place to properly document financial transactions and other uses associated with the block grant allocation.
3. To monitor program income, CHDO profits received and any other financial conditions and requirements.

**SUMMARY OF PROGRAM MONITORING PROCESS:** The CPED/CDA Division Compliance Department works cooperatively with all subrecipients and contractors to ensure that the use of federal funds meets HUD guidelines and performance standards. The CDA compliance department staff uses checklist set forth in HUD guidelines to monitor program performance. The following steps summarize monitoring standards through monitoring plan implementation:

- Conduct the environmental review process for each federally funded activity.
- Prepare a thorough and comprehensive agreement, which sets forth the project/activity requirements.
- Review on-going written status reports and verbal communication to monitor subrecipients for adherence to allowable timelines and compliance requirements.
- Approve reimbursement requests after stringent review of approved budget summaries, invoices, time sheets, and/or other appropriate documents.
- Prepare quarterly project/activity status reports to measure accomplishments to planned activities and contractual obligations.
- Utilize performance measurement outcome system to assess program progress and effectiveness against outcome and output measures as outlined for the particular activity, project, or program:
- Utilize desk monitoring on an on-going basis (quarterly and as needed).
- Conduct on-site visits as deemed necessary during and after the contract period; and
- Execute corrective or remedial actions as prescribed in 24 CFR 570.10 in the event the subrecipient fails to fulfill the terms and conditions of the established agreement between the subrecipients and the City of Youngstown. The Compliance staff will conduct four or more on-site monitoring reviews during the program year.

**Citizen Participation Plan 91.105(d); 91.115(d)**

**Describe the efforts to provide citizens with reasonable notice and an opportunity to comment on performance reports.**

Performance reports are made readily accessible through the City’s website, where residents can view detailed information about various programs and services. This digital accessibility

allows for convenient review by the community. Additionally, Youngstown holds public meetings and comment periods specifically to discuss these performance reports. During these meetings, residents are invited to ask questions, offer feedback, and engage in discussions with City officials and program managers. These sessions are widely advertised to maximize participation. Citizens were notified of the availability of the CAPER plan by newspaper advertisement on September 9, 2024. The Community Development Agency division of Community Planning and Economic Development (CPED) posted a draft of the 2023 CAPER for public review and comment during the period September 10, 2024, through September 25, 2024. The draft was posted on the City of Youngstown website and available in person at City Hall.

**CR-45 - CDBG 91.520(c)**

**Specify the nature of, and reasons for, any changes in the jurisdiction’s program objectives and indications of how the jurisdiction would change its programs as a result of its experiences.**

There is no change in the Jurisdiction’s program objectives in PY2023; public service projects will continue to stabilize neighborhoods through public infrastructure and facilities improvements, crime reduction programs, youth services, workforce development, code enforcement, and housing assistance.

**Does this Jurisdiction have any open Brownfields Economic Development Initiative (BEDI) grants?**

The jurisdiction does not have any open BEDI grants.

**[BEDI grantees] Describe accomplishments and program outcomes during the last year.**

N/A

## **CR-50 - HOME 24 CFR 91.520(d)**

### **Include the results of on-site inspections of affordable rental housing assisted under the program to determine compliance with housing codes and other applicable regulations**

Please list those projects that should have been inspected on-site this program year based upon the schedule in 24 CFR §92.504(d). Indicate which of these were inspected and a summary of issues that were detected during the inspection. For those that were not inspected, please indicate the reason and how you will remedy the situation.

The City Inspectors completed inspection of HOME-funded rental properties. The housing units met the HQ standards. The housing units are also routinely inspected by Youngstown Metropolitan Housing Authority, the State of Ohio Housing Trust, and City code enforcement.

### **Provide an assessment of the jurisdiction's affirmative marketing actions for HOME units. 24 CFR 91.520(e) and 24 CFR 92.351(a)**

All the HOME subrecipients are required to have an affirmative marketing program intended to attract prospective buyers regardless of race, color, national origin, disability, religion, familial status, gender, or sexual orientation. The City and subrecipients follow the market regulations cited at 24 CFR 200.620.

### **Refer to IDIS reports to describe the amount and use of program income for projects, including the number of projects and owner and tenant characteristics**

According to PR 09, the jurisdiction did not receive any HOME program income during the program year.

### **Describe other actions taken to foster and maintain affordable housing. 24 CFR 91.220(k) (STATES ONLY: Including the coordination of LIHTC with the development of affordable housing). 24 CFR 91.320(j)**

In addition to HOME funded projects, CDBG funds were used to repair 246 income-eligible owner-occupied properties in 2023. This allows for area residents to maintain their housing and improve their quality of life.

### CR-58 – Section 3

Identify the number of individuals assisted and the types of assistance provided

<b>Total Labor Hours</b>	<b>CDBG</b>	<b>HOME</b>	<b>ESG</b>	<b>HOPWA</b>	<b>HTF</b>
Total Number of Activities	0	0	0	0	0
Total Labor Hours					
Total Section 3 Worker Hours					
Total Targeted Section 3 Worker Hours					

**Table 14 – Total Labor Hours**

<b>Qualitative Efforts - Number of Activities by Program</b>	<b>CDBG</b>	<b>HOME</b>	<b>ESG</b>	<b>HOPWA</b>	<b>HTF</b>
Outreach efforts to generate job applicants who are Public Housing Targeted Workers					
Outreach efforts to generate job applicants who are Other Funding Targeted Workers.					
Direct, on-the job training (including apprenticeships).					
Indirect training such as arranging for, contracting for, or paying tuition for, off-site training.					
Technical assistance to help Section 3 workers compete for jobs (e.g., resume assistance, coaching).					
Outreach efforts to identify and secure bids from Section 3 business concerns.					
Technical assistance to help Section 3 business concerns understand and bid on contracts.					
Division of contracts into smaller jobs to facilitate participation by Section 3 business concerns.					
Provided or connected residents with assistance in seeking employment including: drafting resumes, preparing for interviews, finding job opportunities, connecting residents to job placement services.					
Held one or more job fairs.					
Provided or connected residents with supportive services that can provide direct services or referrals.					
Provided or connected residents with supportive services that provide one or more of the following: work readiness health screenings, interview clothing, uniforms, test fees, transportation.					
Assisted residents with finding child care.					
Assisted residents to apply for, or attend community college or a four year educational institution.					
Assisted residents to apply for, or attend vocational/technical training.					
Assisted residents to obtain financial literacy training and/or coaching.					
Bonding assistance, guaranties, or other efforts to support viable bids from Section 3 business concerns.					
Provided or connected residents with training on computer use or online technologies.					
Promoting the use of a business registry designed to create opportunities for disadvantaged and small businesses.					
Outreach, engagement, or referrals with the state one-stop system, as designed in Section 121(e)(2) of the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act.					

Other.					
--------	--	--	--	--	--

**Table 15 – Qualitative Efforts - Number of Activities by Program**

**Narrative**